

Fresh markets, a way of life and public health under threat; experiences in Europe and Asia and action for Hanoi

**Stephanie Geertman, Consultant
HealthBridge Liveable Cities Program
October 2010**

1. Introduction

Vietnam is heading towards a new phase, due to rapid economic development the country will be a middle income country in 2011. The development of rapid economic progress causes for a modernization process which is generating many changes in Vietnamese society. In large cities as Hanoi a major change in urban life is the 'supermarket' revolution, the processes is supported by a policy in which local fresh markets are replaced by shopping malls.

As in other middle income countries, this is putting great pressure to Vietnam's traditional fresh food markets, with implications for the country's nutritional status, culinary culture, social fabric and population health. European owned and copied hypermarkets and supermarkets are vying with fresh markets to supply food to the growing middle class.

The entrance of supermarkets in Hanoi started in the 1990s, the large scale hypermarkets, came more recent, one of the first hypermarkets in Hanoi was Metro (wholesale), and the French Big-C opened its doors in 2005. The replacement of open air fresh markets with supermarkets and shopping malls is only very recent. In 2007 the Hanoi People Committee launched an ambitious plan: in 2008 a system of more than 126 new markets would be built in the base of old ones¹. At the same time, gradually all temporary and small street markets would be removed (Trọng Phú, 2007). The new policy is part of the general idea of 'civilization' in which the Hanoi People's Committee (HPC) aims to limit informal activities in the city.

Based on publications and observations of experiences elsewhere in the world, and on a first inventory of the current situation in Hanoi, this paper raises questions about the potential impact of the growth of supermarket chains on fresh markets. Specific questions are raised on how they contribute to the lives of the urban poor, to social cohesion, to national nutrition and as a valued setting for a way of life which is based on social networks acknowledged as contributing to positive health status – or in general, how they contribute to a liveable city for all.

The paper is structured with five sections: (1) This introduction; (2) Situation in Hanoi; (3) Experiences with fresh markets elsewhere, and; (4) Policy implications; and (5) Action for Hanoi.

2. Hanoi

2.1 History of Hanoi as market city

Markets have always been at the center of Hanoi's cultural and economic existence. The economy of the city developed upon a distribution of a market network which was established between ancient Hanoi and the neighboring areas. By the seventeenth century, the city was even given another name, *Ke Cho*, or market place, to reflect the importance of its economic and commercial activities through the existence of markets (Logan 2000; Luan 1997, Hy 2002). The legacy of this economic and

¹ Of which, 65 inner city markets and 61 suburban markets. In 2007 Hanoi has implemented 27 projects of new constructions and renovation markets with a total investment of about 2.000 billions VND (Trọng Phú, 2007).

historical character of Hanoi's culture is represented by the ancient Thirty Six Ancient Streets quarter and guilds (Phe & Nishimura 1990; Girard and Cassagnes 2001). Specific for Thang Long was that its citadel was in symbioses with the rural origins of the place, the villages (Logan 2000; Hy 2002; Thong 2001; Ledent 2002). Market people concentrated in the web of dense villages and hamlets in and around the center of the city, and these villages and hamlets again concentrated in diverse quarters, in streets, in Hanoi: in Ke Cho – the market town (Logan 2000:39).

In the contemporary city there are still large groups of people who come from the country side and sell products at the markets in the city. And many of them have a two-way relationship with the city, they live temporary in the city to sell products at the markets, others are more permanent in the city, but still sell products from relatives living in the villages on the market. The markets in Hanoi as such are part of the historical and cultural identity of the city Hanoi. With exception of the new urban areas, all neighborhoods in Hanoi have fresh markets in the morning, they provide residents with fresh food at affordable prices, and secondly they provide a space for social relationships in neighborhoods to emerge.

“Dusty vegetable stalls, reeking seafood, food stalls mixed here and there, crowded narrow roads and swift-handed sellers, who always smile with their customers and sometimes argue loudly with each other, make up the special atmosphere found at traditional markets” (Le, 2008:26).

The described scene will be recognized by anyone who knows Hanoi, or probably anyone who ever visits Asian fresh markets. In Hanoi, it is reported (Le, 2008:26) and observed by the author that most people still prefer the local fresh markets over supermarkets. In any case, due to their stuffy and messy appearance, the markets do not contribute to the civilization policy (clean and organized street), and probably also due to food safety issues, the HPC started a policy in which traditional fresh markets are largely going to be replaced by supermarkets and hypermarkets.

2.2 Policy: markets will be replaced with shopping centers, super- and hypermarkets.

In 2009 the Hanoi Trade Department proposed to the HPC a plan up to 2020 in which 489 markets, 162 shopping centers of all kinds and 178 hypermarkets, supermarkets will be built. According to the summary of the report, in four old districts (Hoan Kiem, Ba Dinh, Dong Da, Hai ba Trung) no new markets are constructed, only old ones replaced. In the city 402 current markets will be upgraded, which means that large scale markets are going to become shopping centers combined with residential living; and the small markets, will gradually be upgraded into supermarkets, grocery stores, convenience stores. The plan also mentions the selection of 62 current supermarkets to be upgraded as hypermarkets and old markets with the areas of more than 3.000 m² will be upgraded as supermarkets class II and III (Anh Quân, 2009).

The highlights of this project are wholesale markets in the center which have been pulled away from the old inner city area. According to the plan, there will be two wholesale markets of agricultural products and general food in Gia Lam and Thuong Tin district. The plan is also aiming to build new supermarkets class I and II in the new urban center of Tay Ho, Cau Giay, Thanh Xuan, Hoang Mai, Long Bien, Ha Dong districts, Son Tay town, Tu Liem, Hoai Duc and Dan Phuong district.

Particularly in the suburban areas, depending on the number of inhabitants, hypermarkets will be developed. The plan also proposed to build five regional integrated wholesale centers in Gia Lam, Soc Son, Chuong My, Thach That and Thuong Tin district, the size of each center is from 150 to 200 hectares.



Figures 1-3. Hom Market, photographs taken by Nguyen Quang Ninh, 21/11/2009. published in Geertman 2010.

The new supermarkets in the existing city will replace existing markets (figure 1-3), or are planned to develop next to existing markets. Although the policy is to have a part of the new building for the existing vendors, the experience thus far is that the new market buildings are often not designed for existing vendors and customers of the traditional fresh markets. Instead they become new sites for economic profit making by the involved developers. At the same time fresh markets are not included anymore in new urban areas, instead supermarkets and hypermarkets are constructed (Geertman 2010; Geertman & Thong 2010; Giao Thong Van Tai, 2010). In addition the HPC started a ban on street vendors (2008), including sellers in alleyways and footpaths that, technically, are also the traditional markets, although the latter is still largely ignored by vendors in Hanoi, these new policies will have great implications for Hanoi's existing market culture in Hanoi.

2.3 New and renovated markets in Hanoi

"Rubbish lies scattered here and there on the dusty floor. Half of the stalls are vacant, and those that are open lay bare, with few goods for sale, mostly clothes, plastics, dried produce and cheap cosmetics. A couple of women, looking disinterested, wander around".

This is an observation of the scene at the new Khuong Dinh market in Hanoi's Khuong Trung Street by Kim Thai (2008). It shows an example of a renovated market which after five years after opening still fails to attract traders to lease all of its stalls.

The new markets are unsuitable for small traders for daily use, in terms of both design and cost. All have at least two or three floors with few windows, and are unsuitable for the sale of fresh food and foodstuffs, particularly in a humid and hot climate. "If fresh food shops were on the first floor, their smells rise to the upper floors," said Mr Quang Tung, an experienced architect in the same article (Kim Thai 2008:22).

Actually most new markets are purposely designed to become commercial centers rather than places with affordable fresh foods from the surrounding country side. Some are even designed for high-end services, like offices and apartments for lease on the upper floors. Investors and managers are therefore unwilling to sully the good image of their new buildings by allowing fresh food to be sold on the first floor (Kim Thai, 2008:23). Instead of providing space for the fresh food markets, today supermarkets emerge, however they can't replace many of the functions of fresh markets: cheap fresh food and they do not provide the conditions for social relationships to emerge as at local fresh markets.

"I like shopping at the clean and well-equipped supermarkets but I am still attracted to the atmosphere at the traditional markets, where you can find more human contact as well as the friendly smiles of simple and sincere people, which you can't find at luxury shopping centers," said 25-year-old Ms Vo Huong Lan from Hue (Le, 2008:26).

"In our culture traditional markets are where people meet together to chat and share some gossip," said Mr Phu. "This level of communication doesn't exist at supermarkets." (idem)

In 2007 the Ministry of Industry and Trade announced that around 97 per cent of traditional markets are still up and running, despite the fierce competition from modern supermarkets and mini-marts, which are now increasing significantly in terms of numbers and service quality. Yet this boom has not overrun traditional markets. Forty per cent of products are purchased at traditional markets, compared to around 10 per cent in supermarkets (Le, 2008:26).

And of course the prices at fresh markets are more interesting because products are affordable for customers, and for vendors all the cost like seats, license tax, business tax, cleaning services, security to rent one place are all lower than the new built markets (Ngoisao.net, 2006).

A prime example of a current market being replaced with a new one is the Hang Da market center Hanoi.

2.3 Example of Hang Da Market²

Hang Da market is located in the 36 street area, at Ha Trung Street. The old Hang Da market is already demolished, but has many similar characteristic with for example the Hom Market (figure 1-3). The new Hang Da market covers the old space of the traditional Hang Da market, 3,367 square meters (0.3367 ha) (Geertman, 2010:212). In this development, the HPC works together with private investors, and they choose architects. The design of this market is from Ho Thieu Tri, a well known French, from Vietnamese origin, architect in Hanoi.

The construction has started in the second quarter of 2009 and was finished just before the celebration of the 1000 years of Thang Long / Hanoi, 10 October 2010. The project is an investment of 220 billion VND (11.5 million USD)³ by three companies consisting of the Red River Construction Joint stock company (PVC Incomex), Nhat Nam Joint Stock Company and Investment & Trade Limited

2 The information of the Hang Da Market is collected in a research by the author for the University of Neuchâtel, Switzerland, and published in the report: *The Globalization of Urban Form in Hanoi* (Geertman 2010).

3 <http://www.thesaigontimes.vn/Home/dothi/hatang/14077/> - date consulted website: 30 January 2009. Language: Vietnamese

Company KAF. Exclusive leasing is done by the global real estate consultant, Savills⁴, for Hanoi Savills Vietnam Limited Company⁵. It is obvious that all these involved companies are interested in economic profit of the new market. Savills is leading in exclusive property leasing, and the design of the new building looks like a French style shopping mall for upper end customers (see figure 4).



Figure 4: New Hang Da Market, source architect Ho Trieu Tri, earlier published in Geertman 2010.

All the sellers at Hang Da are temporary relocated in a linear street behind the market area. In interviews conducted with vendors at this markets for a research for the University of Neuchâtel conducted by this author, they said that they expect to move back to the market when it is finished. However, the new building will be a shopping center, and as with most other new markets in Hanoi today, it's design is not suitable for local vendors and customers buying fresh products, second it will become too expensive for the vendors to return. As showed by the drawing of the architect of the new market, the new building will host many other luxurious shops, and it is planned for people with cars, thus for middle and upper class customers, and definitely not for daily household shopping for fresh foods.

In short, the entrance of super- and hypermarkets, related to the new aim of economic profit making is giving great pressure to fresh-markets and socio-economic life in Hanoi. Although there are aspects typical for Hanoi and Vietnam, the process of privatization and commercialization is also affecting many other fresh markets in other cities and countries elsewhere in the world. It would require one separate research to identity all these developments and compare all. For our purpose we introduce here some of these other experiences, with as aim to get more understanding of the contribution of fresh markets to a livable city.

3. Aspects of fresh markets contributing to a livable city, from experiences elsewhere

In this third part we introduce existing research and policy making related to fresh markets in other cities, as examples for how Hanoi could or should not take action. Most information is retrieved from research and policy making of two cities in Europe, Amsterdam and London, and two in Asia, Bangkok

4 Savills is a global real estate services provider listed on the London Stock Exchange . They have an international network of more than 200 offices and associates throughout the Americas, the UK, continental Europe, Asia Pacific, Africa and the Middle East, offering a broad range of specialist property advisory, management and transactional services to clients all over the world.

5 <http://www.vnexpress.net/GL/Kinh-doanh/Bat-Dong-san/Du-an/2009/07/3BA10BE4/> - date consulted website: 30 January 2009. Language: Vietnamese.

and Hong Kong. In both European and Asian cities there is a long standing history of markets, which belongs to most of the city cultures in these continents. Although with differences, the fresh-markets in all four cities are under threat due to new super- and hypermarkets replacing fresh markets, at the same time in all four cities fresh markets are still very popular by the population. From the several researches and policy making documents we identified six aspects related to fresh markets in general and the impact of replacing them with shopping-malls in particular, which we found important to address for the case in Hanoi; (3.1) social relationships in neighborhoods; (3.2) well-being; (3.3) nutrition; (3.4); cheap versus expensive (price of goods); (3.5); cultural ways of life, and to; (3.6) the local economy.

3.1 Social relationships

The research of Queens Market in East London, is part of a larger research by the University of London, and published as *Public Spaces, Social Relations and Well-being in East London* (Dines et al. 2006). A strong feature of both interviews and discussion groups in the research in East London was that informants tended to describe public open spaces in terms of their interaction with other people rather than focusing simply on the places themselves. Their narratives highlighted the importance of the relationship between people and place (2006:13).

The report suggests that the relationship between public spaces and local attachment is dynamic, and that social interaction in public space can play a pivotal role in this relationship. While commitment to the local area and its people often influences the experience of public open spaces, the opportunities for social encounters in public spaces are also often key to people's allegiance to their local area (2006:13). The conclusion in this research was that Queens Market was like "*no other space in the local area*" (2006:35), and they concluded, "*it [the market] appeared to play such a valued social and cultural role for so many people*" (idem).

One of the most varied aspects of public spaces in general and the market in particular identified in the London research was the opportunity for informal interaction. Casual encounters, which ranged from meetings with friends and neighbors in residential areas to brief exchanges with strangers in markets.

In a national research of markets in The Netherlands (Esselink et al 2004:5), the results are supporting the conclusions from the research in London, it was concluded that the markets more than ever before will become a *meeting place*. And it was argued that the market has a great role in social integration of people in neighborhoods and in cities. Especially migrants from other regions and countries have chances to interact with each other. The research showed that in the Netherlands, people visit the market for its fresh food products, secondly to meet people and thirdly for the low price (idem). Research from Thailand also emphasized the important role of fresh markets in social interactions in neighborhoods and between people in general.

The research in Thailand (Banwell et al. 2010), examined the role of fresh markets in Thailand's nutritional status and culture, ethnographic fieldwork was undertaken in seven markets located in each of the north, north-east, central and southern regions. The markets were located in major regional centers (including the outskirts of Bangkok) and were selected to represent a variety of market types, ranging from mainly retail to wholesale, renovated or not, and car or pedestrian focused.

In this research informants using fresh markets said:

"This is a way of life, always has been like this": It's great atmosphere": "It brings great relations

between producers and consumers": "We bring a brother-sister relationship between buyers and sellers...its still present, but not as much as in the past": and,, "People of my age, love the relationships with the sellers" (Banwell et al. 2010:9).

Consumers become part of a network which includes market vendors by incorporating market visits into their daily routines such as shopping on their way home from work or other activities (Banwell et al 2010:9). Another research about the markets in Bangkok has shown that market women close relationships evolve into supporting roles, which may include: financial sharing and support programs, sickness benefit support, counseling services for women having troubles including marital problems, assisting abused women, and sharing market information (Jaibun 2006).

In her paper *An Ethnographic Comparison of Wet Markets and Supermarkets in Hong Kong*, Lui (2008) compares the use of fresh markets and supermarkets in Hong Kong. She as well argues that fresh markets and supermarkets provide a social space for social interaction, ultimately fostering a solid networking and recalling a sense of communal belonging (2008:5). However, in her discussion of different social relations at fresh markets she also argues why fresh markets create warmer and deeper social relationships than supermarkets do, we discuss briefly three of these relationships. First is the seller-buyer relationship.

"Supermarket staff seems to be friendlier than sellers in wet markets. After all, they are working for big corporations. Still, I think seller-buyer relationships in wet markets are principally warmer than that of in supermarkets. I distinguish the term "friendly" and "warm" based on the degree of intimacy of the relationship. A warm relationship is somehow at a deeper level than the friendly one. It is the responsibility of supermarket staff to treat customers friendly and politely. But this does not mean they can give you the feeling of warmth. The friendly appeal just gives customers a more "comfortable" feeling in raising questions. Actually, many sellers are rude, but they are friendly to their regular customers and treat them as friends" (Lui, 2008:4).

This quote is from Ada, a mid twenties university student in Hong Kong, and key-informant in the research about the ethnography in fresh markets and supermarkets in in Hong Kong .

Lui explains that the warm relationship in Hong Kong is known as *yahn chihng meih*, she says this is loosely equivalent to being considerate and showing concern (Lui, 2008:4). Aside sellers, also buyers value this particular warm relationship, which is shown in this research by the quote of one of the vendors at the fresh market:

"The maintenance of good relationships with customers is what makes your business survive. Regardless of how brief the conversation is, maybe three sentences at maximum, and how mundane the content is, the relationships can still be built on this causal chatting." (Lui, 2008:4)

The quotes from this research in Hong Kong suggest that both sellers and buyers in fresh markets value the warm relationships which emerge through interactions by daily conversation and the subsequent in-depth interaction going beyond transactions. Both parties relish the special attention they received and value the good personal feelings and the long term, mutually beneficial relationships (Lui, 2008:6).

A main conclusion from Lui's research in Hong Kong is that "Cost-saving and efficiency mentality in the supermarket industry brutally devalue seller-buyer relationships" (Lui 2008:10).

Second relationship are the friendships and neighborhood relationships. Household shopping in both

fresh markets as supermarkets in Hong Kong supports friendships to be maintained and are places to feel part of the neighborhood. In Hong Kong mothers visit in groups of two or four fresh markets and supermarkets, and so do elderly people (Lui, 2008:13). Underhill (1995) remarks the use of shopping as a means of socializing for which women “like to shop with friends, egging each other on and rescuing each other from ill-advised purchases” (p.115).

Third kind of relationships are employees and employers. In general, Lui argues, employer and employee relationships are more intimate in fresh markets. For example, she writes, during lunch the stall is closed and the boss and employees have lunch together, eating and sharing food is a kind of activity symbolically creating a boundary and communicating solidarity within this boundary. “The practice is a mainstay of forming the bonds between employers and employees in fresh markets” (Lui 2008:12).

As such the sense of belonging is less likely for supermarket staff to be developed. The management of a supermarket has in many features adopted the “rational” McDonalized systems of efficiency, calculability, predictability and control, a phenomenon known as McDonaldization (Ritzer, 2001). Working in a dehumanized supermarkets setting, supermarket staff becomes dispassionate and feel themselves as nothing but a part of an assembly line or reduced to cogs of machine (Lui 2008:13).

Another research in Thailand argues that, supermarkets are unlikely to replicate these benefits for either workers or consumers because they establish a relationship with less social solidarity between staff and consumers and they rely less on local produce (Jaibun, 2006).

Thus, when replacing or renovating fresh-markets it is important to not just look at the economic consequences, but also the social impact: “Redeveloping of a retail site is destruction of a social space” (Dines et al, 2006:35)

Aside from the so important social interactions on fresh markets, Dines et al (2006:14) also identify three other aspects important to consider when a fresh market is regenerated. People are emotional attached to a place, and prefer continuity, fresh markets are important to give local facilities to residents and people perceive a local market as an important asset that plays part in a neighborhoods place identity. These aspects are all contributing to a greater sense of well-being by individuals using the fresh markets.

3.2 Well-being

Well-being is understood as a positive concept; a dimension of a 'social model' of health that locates individual experience within social contexts (Bowling, 1991; Blaxter, 2004). Issues connected to the effect of policy interventions on people's perceptions of their well-being are gaining prominence (see, for example, Dolan, 2005). Much is already known about influences such as the role of social networks, social support, humour and leisure activities as well as job satisfaction on people's quality of life, well-being and perceptions of happiness (see, for example, Diener and Ratz, 2000). Recently, concerned attempts have been made to examine how such questions play out in public space. The ways in which people describe their experiences of public spaces (and other local features and resource) can reveal the contexts in which their well-being is experienced (Ellaway et al, 2001; Airey, 2003, Dines et al 2006).

In the research of Queens Market in London it was reported that simple gestures such as nods and smiles were often reassuring and could establish the basis for future, closer contact. The social encounters in Queens Market made some people feel happy, safe and relaxed, and could raise their

spirits (Dines et al 2006:28).

In the same research informants pointed to markets (and streets) as therapeutic spaces. Their value lay in the shared elements of public space, in the social vibrancy of urban life and seeing other people. “For older informants especially, they can provide the main daily source of outdoor recreation and can be an enjoyable experience. Although not directly fresh markets, it is also interesting to mention that in this research various nondescript neighborhood spaces, often literally outside the front door, were also singled out by people who claimed strong social ties with their immediate surrounding area” (Dines et al 2006:30).

Fresh markets seen as a public space where social interactions occurs, are as such, important physical settings for everyday experiences, they are also perceived in the East London research as spaces which possess a host of subjective meanings that accumulate over time. Memories of favorite places can have an important influence on well-being. Intimate recollections of growing up (Dines et al 2006:27).

For most people, everyday public spaces, [as fresh-markets] provide opportunities both as places of interaction and as places of retreat. Public spaces that are able to bring people together and where friendships and support networks are made and maintained are key to a general sense of well-being. Both fleeting and more meaningful encounters in public spaces can provide relief from daily routines, sustenance for people's sense of community, and can alleviate tensions at home or in a neighborhood (Dines et al 2006:28).

Thus, fresh markets, have a direct impact on well-being of people, they contribute to a greater sense of well-being and thus to public health of its users. It is important to remember that presumably the point of economic growth is to increase well-being. It thus does not make sense to engage in activities that reduce well-being for the sake of growing the economy.

Aside social relationships and well-being, of course one of the most obvious impacts of fresh-markets on people's public health is nutrition.

3.3 Nutrition transition and food safety

“In the Thai context, the current ready access to fresh markets appears to favor health outcomes for the poorer Thais who have lower BMIs than wealthier and more urban Thais” (Banwell et al., 2009: Lim et al., 2009).

This conclusion of the research in Thailand is a typical example of the 'nutrition transition' which is shorthand for a complex web of social, economic and cultural changes occurring in middle-income countries (Popkin, 2003). At its heart lies a widespread, albeit patchy, shift from under-nutrition to over-nutrition, with concomitant changes to health risks and growth in conditions such as obesity. This development is accompanied with the rapid expansion of supermarkets and hypermarkets, in Thailand it caused for a loss of around 2500 small retailers (Hawkes, 2008).

Respected nutrition transition authorities have proposed that in middle income countries which Vietnam will be in less than a year, hyper/supermarkets are primarily responsible for the diffusion of the high energy, low nutrient processed food which are associated with the negative consequences of the nutrition transition (Mendez and Popkin, 2004). In public health terms this is not a desirable development given that the plant based foods available to large numbers of Vietnamese through fresh markets at affordable prices are considered to be among the health protective foods (Mann, 2000).

However, supermarkets in Hanoi do sell components of traditional local diets, however in a very limited extend. Yet, these products in supermarkets are often not similar to quality at fresh markets, and they actively aim on the new rising middle-class which is demanding for more hygiene and blemish-free products.

The experience of Western countries demonstrates that large super/hypermarkets chains are very successful at gaining market share over time. Their increasing penetration of the food system brings public health and economic gains and losses. On the negative side, nutrition transition scholars have noted that the growth in transnational food processing corporations, including supermarkets, makes high fat, sugar and salt foods more accessible and affordable (Hawkes, 2008), which may usurp the place of raw staple foods in individual diets (Vinkeles Melchers, N., et al., 2009).

Thus the new middle class in general is now having a diet which is less healthy than when they only used the fresh market. At the same time, this new middle class has a new perspective on hygienic shopping, and also demand for more safe food. Where diet worsens and non-communicable disease (diabetes, heart disease, stroke, cancers) increase as a result, there is again a negative economic result, as governments, insurance companies and the individuals themselves all must pay the cost of treatment, and bear the other costs of premature illness and death. Again, economic policies should not be encouraged that are likely to reduce rather than increase well-being.

Food safety & Hygiene

In the research in Thailand many vendors at fresh markets said that the demand for produce that was blemish-free has led to the overuse of pesticides and the use of food colorings and additives on products sold in the fresh markets. And many vendors and consumers thought that food may look better but not taste as good as in the past (Banwell 2010:11). Thus the products with pesticides may look good, but their quality is actually lower than the products which have some spots on them.

In this case supermarkets win from fresh markets, despite public health improvements to fresh markets, supermarkets use food safety to claim superiority and create a point of distinction (Goldman et al., 2009). In Thailand this leads to certification costs for food safety, which can inflate the price of a food considerably (Van der Geest, 2006). It also has environmental and health consequences from the increased use of dangerous pesticides.

In recent years in Vietnam there have been many reports on problems with food safety and hygiene on fresh-markets. Although Vietnam has an Ordinance on Food Hygiene and Safety, the World Health Organisation says that approximately one-tenth of the Vietnamese population, or eight million people, suffer from food poisoning each year (Cam Quyen 2009). To combat the problems there is a new Law on Food Safety in the making (Vietnam Net 2010). Problems in Vietnam are that vendors do not know the basic rules of hygiene, and often when there are inspections and explanations by inspectors, the habits are not changed. A problem is that inspection teams do not have the right to sanction the violators so violations are repeated (Theo 2008). Food safety concerns fresh markets and many sidewalks have street food., and they do not only relate to pesticides and hygiene, but also from malpractice like this:

"...we caught on-site the poultry stands of unknown origin, chicken legs were directly splitted so that the consumers can see clearly the fluid that was pumped into the chicken was made of boiled pig's skin but they still buy. This fluid is pumped in order to make the chicken thigh looks more succulent and heavier ... " (inspector interviewed in report by (Duy Tién 2009).

It is reported that inspections at markets occurs, but that, “the situation turned back the same” (Duy Tiến 2009).

From a recent interviews with well-off Hanoians, they told us that they perceive food-safety and hygiene, as the primary reason to abandon the fresh-market, and now only use supermarkets (Geertman 2010). For all citizens it is important to improve the situation at the markets in Hanoi, to make them cleaner, keep closer watch on food safety, especially for the urban poor, but it is also important to keep the markets attractive, and keep also more well-off citizens interested to visit the fresh-markets, which is important for social integration of different groups and for the local economy.

With the pressure on fresh markets, and many scandals with food safety, especially with pesticides and the raising awareness of the use of pesticides on health and environment, there is a raising awareness of organic food almost everywhere around the world. While there are more visible food safety issues with vendors and traditional markets, and there is the food poisoning issue, that tends to be acute and not have lasting effects, versus the dangerous effect of consuming foods that contain various chemicals or are heavily processed, effects that are more long-term and dangerous like cancer. Given that trade-off, it is not at all clear that supermarkets always deliver safer food.

Trend for Organic Markets

In the simplest way 'organic food “is produced without artificial fertilizers or pesticides using instead only organic-based fertilizers like manure and vegetable-based compost, and natural pesticides, such as predator animal species” (OECD 2003:18). The role of local production is also emphasized.

Direct contact with local organic farmers promises consumers a highly transparent production process about “who grows their food and under what conditions” and allows them to gather “nutritional and culinary information”, boosting their confidence in origin and quality since farm-fresh food “has not been stored or transported for miles, losing important nutrients and taste” (OECD 2003:42).

In general 'the organic lifestyle' refers to the resurgence of traditional lifestyles following natural principles. These principles comprise naturalness, healthfulness, wellness and harmony, which can be achieved through the consumption of fresh, natural, healthy, seasonal food and the maintenance of a sustainable, balanced, productive ecosystem.

This trend can be seen in all the countries of the examples discussed in this paper. However, the amount to organic food produced and available for sale is limited, meaning that some consumers have access to organic food while others do not.

This is a problem in all industrialized countries, the ultimate goal of organic markets is part of the idea of achieving harmony with the body and with nature for everyone. However, the choice to go organic is a rather uneven process, being dictated by economic capital. For Hong Kong Lui notes that the scantily of few organic markets in this city results in well-off people using cars and travel long distance for the sake of fresh organic green products...(2008:44).

Thus, organic markets in their current phase are too limited and thus too exclusive. Although they are health improving, they are only affordable by the more well-off, as such they do not contribute much to the urban poor: the problems with the availability of fresh and safe food which is affordable for all still remains.

Supermarkets in developed countries do provide affordable food, however this is high energy, low

nutrient processed food. What happens is that a shift takes place of urban poor buying this cheap and not nutritious food, while the well-off shops at expansive organic markets. An important message to all policymakers is: to improve nutrition by making organic food available at affordable prices at 'normal' fresh markets.

In middle income countries which are just experiencing the supermarket revolution as the cases referred to in this paper, Thailand, Hong Kong and Vietnam, the organic markets are also destinations for the well-off. However, supermarkets are not destinations for the lesser well off, they are still too expensive for them.

Thus the policy in Vietnam which is assumed to lead to a decline of fresh markets in the city in favor of super and hypermarkets will inevitably contribute to a great decline in nutrition by a large part of the mostly poorer population. In addition this will directly increase the already rising gap between rich and poor in Vietnam, it will make fresh and healthy food less affordable for the lesser well off.

3.4 Fresh-markets versus Supermarkets – Cheap versus expensive

In Thailand the average market-basket of goods from a traditional market costs 9 % less than the equivalent basket of goods from the three major hypermarkets retailers in 2004 (average across the country to manage regional differences)(Schaffner et al., 2005).

In the research in Hong Kong, the price comparison quantified the relationship between fresh markets and supermarkets in a pair of opposition: cheap versus expensive (Lui 2008: 18). The case in Hong Kong also showed that price level increased in a ten year period (between 1993 to 2003), despite a significantly deflated economy.

Younger generations often embrace new developments much faster than the older generation. At the same time in the contexts of rapid economic progress, the younger generation does not know poverty like their parents do. For the supermarket revolution this means that the younger generation accepts easily to pay more for convenience. An example is the increased use of the younger generation of the supermarket in Hong Kong. "I still choose to shop in Park'n Superstore even though goods are more expansive than fresh markets. Convenience takes precedence to price. My mother in law had grumbled several times for my misappropriate use of money. It is a generational gap" (Rachel, key informant in Lui's research in Hong Kong, 2008:19).

The above shows the dichotomy part of a generation issue for the case in Hong Kong, the older generation growing up in hardship and cautiously about spending, and the younger generation that are eager to pay more for convenience.

The other dimension is the class difference. The new entrance of the new supermarkets supports the new middle class, who possess affluent economic capital to afford a high standard of living. Convenience is an integral part of the middle-class lifestyle while it is an extravagance for members of working class and of lower class (Lui 2008:19).

Research on supermarkets' impact on developing countries shows that it is the younger, wealthier, urban middle-class that are more likely to shop at supermarkets (Gorton, M., et al., 2009, D'Haese et al., 2008, Figue and Moustier, 2009).

For the lesser well-off in society the fresh markets are the place where they can buy affordable fresh

food. Another great difference with supermarkets is that at fresh markets price is flexible, negatively it can be used to manipulate customers (rounding up the price, weight which is not correct), positively it is used to bargain and uses the interest of customers. In the most socially equitable sense, it allows those who are willing and able to pay more to do so, while giving the possibility of lower prices for those who cannot afford to pay more. This is a possibility that obviously does not exist in supermarkets, except in the choice of less nutritious, cheaper foods.

Researchers Figuié and Moustier (2008) researched the rise of supermarkets in Vietnam, and It shows that poor consumers depend on a diversified network of formal and informal outlets to ensure food accessibility, credit opportunities and low prices. Poor consumers purchase very little from supermarkets due to material constraints (price, transport, etc.), although they have a high opinion of supermarkets and in particular the quality of the products sold. The researchers conclude that in order to be favorable to poor consumers, food distribution policies should aim to maintain the balance of the different forms of outlets and enforce public quality standards to guarantee the right of all to safe food (2008:2010).

Thus, closing down fresh-markets in favor of the development of supermarkets will have a direct impact on the lesser well-off. They will not have access in the supermarkets to affordable healthy fresh food. When fresh-markets are really declining, and the supermarkets win, the lesser-well off will purchase the cheaper and less nutritious foods. In addition with the decline of fresh-markets in cities, a part of the cultural way of life on fresh markets get's under pressure as well.

3.5 Cultural ways of life

“The stall-holders themselves were closely connected by intertwined kinship, friendship and commercial networks. Stalls were passed down through generations (often from mother to daughter), stall holders bought from and sold to each other, and consumers became part of these networks over many years”. (Banwell, 2010:9).

As mentioned in part 3.1, fresh markets are the place where people interact with each other, they meet friends and make new friends, it contributes greatly to social integration, and as such social cohesion in neighborhoods. And as explained, this is an important feature for residents to feel attached to a local area and . This is also related to culture, people gossip at the markets, but also exchange information of the food, the quality, they are aware where the products come from and the vendors inform customers how to prepare foods. Often local and regional products can only to be found on local fresh markets.

Due to this special culture of fresh markets in which local people interact and unique local foods are sold the fresh markets have become important places for local culture. In the research conducted of the market in East London, informants perceived the local market as an important asset that played a key part in the borough's place identity (Dines et al. 2006:14).

Thus local markets are important places for local culture, the identity of the place, as such they are the places where the local feel they 'belong' and they are an attraction to local and international tourists looking for an authentic culinary experience.

Markets in European and Asian cities are seen as important assets to the identity of these cities. Many fresh markets in cities as Amsterdam, Paris, Barcelona, London, Hong Kong, Thailand and in Hanoi have become interesting spots for tourists to explore local culinary and daily culture. This is often supported by local governments

In Amsterdam for example there is a demand for a new policy (Hoogerwerf 2007), which is promoting the city as a Market City: 'A diversity of markets makes the city as a word city'. They mean to say that the diversity of markets all around the city makes local products, food and local daily life accessible for all, for both local people as tourists. In addition due to the great amount of different cultures living in the city it represents Amsterdam as a multicultural city at the same time. As Hanoi, the city of Amsterdam knows a history of specialized markets, however their position changed over time. When the market ones was visited by everyone, today the market in Amsterdam provides affordable products and fresh-food to largely to less well off (however still visited by well-off for its ambiance and specific fresh products). Since the 1960s, the markets in Amsterdam, as in Hanoi since recently, are also pressured by supermarkets and other stores. However, the markets in Amsterdam are still surviving and are an perceived as an important asset in the city culture and local economy.

As in Amsterdam, in many European and Asian cities there are examples of markets in inner city centers which are perceived as important cultural assets. The renovated markets, upgrade the area, but at the same time they emphasize the traditional culture of the market in keeping social structures and foods. As such the market remains an anchor for the social cohesion in a neighborhood and at the same time it supports the local economy as a tourist destination. But with keeping the market available and affordable for local residents as well, for both vendors and customers.

In Thailand, there is the example of the 100 year old wooden Sam Chuk market in Suphanburi which was completely refurbished in 2003, with the idea to becoming a cultural institution and a tourist destination. During the week the major consumers at the market are local residents, although at weekends, tourists arrive in large numbers courtesy of bus tours. Seller look forward to the weekends because they are proud to sell what their ancestors produced and sold.

In Hanoi, not only the older markets in the inner city are interesting places for tourist to go, like Dong Xuan Market, also the street markets are places valued by both tourists as local as a specific habit of Vietnam, a CNN reported writes "hitting the streets may be the most delicious way to discover Vietnamese cuisine (O'Neil for CNN 2000). Supporting more markets and street (food) markets would not only contribute to the local way of life, but also to the local economy when they become tourist destinations as well.

The cultural way of life by eating on the streets and the culinary culture part of fresh markets are characteristics that the supermarkets do not have. Thus by replacing fresh markets with super and hypermarkets, and cleaning side walks for it informal activities is an action which is similar in 'taking a part of the cities culture away'. And this is not only drastic for the cities cultural identity, but as already mentioned also for the cities local economy.

3.6 Local Economy

The value of the traditional character of the above discussed Sam Chuk market is currently being vigorously protected by stall holders who are threatened by the imminent arrival of a new Tesco Lotus [supermarket chain] to be built nearby. As in other localities (Isaacs, 2009), they have held public demonstrations against Tesco Lotus and the market site is festooned with a banner objecting to Tesco Lotus.

"I don't mind Lotus coming here: its air conditioned, fair price and good quality, but I don't want it to come too close. If it's far and does not affect the community's economy, I'm okay, but otherwise it could be a threat." (a male vendor in research Banwell et al 2010: 10).

This quote encapsulates the centrality of markets to a sense of community, and the value of the markets to the local economy. When a supermarket enters a neighborhood the fresh market is immediately threatened, it will need to compete with the new market.

Fresh-markets provide not only customers with cheap fresh food, but also provide jobs for many people in the area. A research of markets in Thailand supports this:

"..fresh markets also supply, tens of thousands of often independent livelihoods, particularly to woman" (Jaibun, 2006).

At present in Hanoi, the renovated / replaced old markets lease space to vendors, however as said in the beginning of this paper, the spaces are not suitable for fresh markets. With as result that vendors can't sell their products in the new markets in Hanoi.

"Very few people want to go inside, as they can get everything they need in shops on the street in front of the market," said Ms Thanh, the owner of a plastics shop in the market. "I'm looking for someone to sublease my stall, because I can't make enough money here." (Kim Thai 2008:22)

Today food production in Vietnam is mostly developed from small-scale production. Small-scale of the total 390,000 units, 80% are small-scale and household producers (Vietnam News 2007). This means the fresh-markets in Vietnam are still the dominating places where fresh-food is sold. As such renovating these markets needs to be done with great care for this large scale local economy.

However, as we have seen in the case of Hang Da at the beginning of this paper, the design and function of the new market buildings do not support the maintenance of the local culture of the fresh market in Hanoi. This means research needs to be done to understand how new markets can successfully contribute to the market culture in Hanoi. In addition it is important to understand the interaction between shops and the market, not only does a new supermarket greatly influence the local economy in an area, also the small shops and market are depending on each other.

From a research in The Netherlands (Esselink et al 2004) it was concluded that fresh markets have great benefits of a good functioning network of shops nearby, at the same time the shops have great benefits of a good functioning market. Many people visit markets and shops, when a market is replaced this is immediately influencing other retailers in the area and other public services, like restaurants, cafe's etc. De interaction between market, shops and hospitality is therefore an important ingredient of a diverse, dynamic and inviting (inner) city or neighborhood (Esselink et al 2004:2).

Thus renovating or replacing fresh markets has a direct impact on the local economy in the area. When a market is replaced is needs to be looked at how this can be done in such a way it improves the local economy in the area, at present it is more destroying the local economy in areas in the city.

4. Conclusion & Policy Implications

The public space research done in London, gives an interesting conclusion, and says that for many informants, it emerged that hard spaces such as shopping and residential streets, markets, street corners and forecourts were equally important in their social lives as local parks, if not more so (Dines et al 2006:37).

They were also critical about the recent debates about public space in the policy arena and the media

which, they argue, have been framed around the need to reverse the 'decline' of public space and the importance of delivering high-quality urban design. "As pointed out, this has tended to disregard the role that 'unexceptional' spaces play in people's everyday lives" (Dines et al 2006:37). By emphasizing the social and therapeutic aspects of public space, this report calls for a more sensitive and less prescriptive approach to understanding people's relationship with public spaces, and presents a challenge to the nature of current debates.

Their study has identified a range of characteristics of public spaces that people value, but rather than offer a definition of an 'ideal' model of public open space, it suggests instead that people will need a variety of public spaces within a local area to meet a range of everyday needs. This will include spaces to linger as well as spaces of transit; spaces that bring people together as well as spaces of retreat. For our case Hanoi, where all public spaces are taken over by motorbikes, cars or commercial functions this is an important conclusion.

In the cases of Hong Kong and Thailand the researchers are concerned, not much policy action has been taken in these cities for the maintenance of fresh-markets in these countries.

In the discussion of the pressure on fresh markets in Hong Kong Lui argues that fresh markets would increasingly be pushed to the very edge of survival unless the government adjusts its apathetic attitude and interferes with the competition between traditional business and modern capitalist corporations. Predicament of tradition seems to be part of the modern condition. It is time for the government to consider repositioning its role in resolving anxieties and ambivalence, and hopefully, in pumping greater resources to do so (Lui 2008:37). Which assumes that aside the policies which regulate food safety and hygiene on markets (mentioned earlier), the government in Hong Kong has not taken any specific city wide policy measures to maintain the markets (yet).

For the pressure on markets in Thailand the situation is similar, Mutebi (2007) argues that policy intervention is required if poor health and social outcomes from this growth are to be avoided. Banwell et al, writes that currently, no one government body is responsible for addressing the survival of fresh markets: the regulation of retail trade is an economic and commercial issue whereas the regulation of fresh markets is considered a health issue (Banwell et al 2010:13). The latter also proposed to the Thai government in their report that they could use cultural continuity, health promoting social networks and the preservation of the once healthy culinary culture as reasons to intervene to safeguard the futures of fresh markets (2010:13).

In the Netherlands the markets are part of policies of the government, they have clear regulations for safety, hygiene and competition. At the same time markets are promoted as enjoyable places to linger and meet new people and cultures, and for its cheap price. The government promotes the markets on by TV spots in between other commercials. It is also encouraged for market vendors, shopkeepers in the neighborhood and local governments to work together in organizing events and rules in areas (Esselink et al 2004).

In comparison to Hong Kong and Thailand, in Vietnam more policy action is taken to protect the fresh markets. It is proposed that investment should be made in upgrading markets and that easy credit be offered to markets traders to improve their stalls (Figuie and Moustier 2009). Fresh-markets and traditional retailing is in particular important to poor consumers and for equity reasons it would be good when the diversity of retail outlets should be maintained. However when we observe the functioning of the current new markets in Hanoi and read the reports we have discussed in this paper the fresh-markets are not protected well enough, and more detailed policy actions is urgently required. However, if the government wishes to safeguard the maintenance of the fresh-markets, offer a diversity of food

retail formats, and provide choice for consumers, it should acknowledge the socio-cultural and nutritional importance of fresh markets in more detail in its policies, and it should acknowledge that they need to protect the fresh-markets from global super-markets chains.

5. Action for Hanoi

This position paper is meant as an introduction to the situation in Hanoi in which the cities fresh-markets have become targets for redeveloping which mostly results in economic profit-making, threatening public health and a cultural way of life. This paper is part of an awareness raising campaign by HealthBridge with aims to have a policy by 2011 which protects the fresh markets in the city Hanoi. The awareness raising campaign will be supported by a research.

Research is needed asking people in neighborhoods of fresh markets how these markets contribute to their sense of well-being and to the social structure in the area. Results of this research will or will not support a demand to policy makers to protect local fresh markets and recognize them as a important value to the Vietnamese traditional way of life, to the social cohesion in an area, to the nutrition of people, especially the urban poor, and to well-being and public health of both stall holders and customers in general. This research will focus on the six important aspects in which fresh markets contribute to a liveable city. We end here with a summary of these six aspects.

First, we perceive public space as a social space, a market is thus also *social space*. When replacing or renovating fresh-markets it is important to not just look at the economic consequences, but also to include the social impact. The social relationships in markets in Hanoi needs to be researched, how important are these relationship and what is the health-improving character of these relationships, how do they contribute to social cohesion and sense of belonging to a neighborhood, and what is the impact of renovating or replacing a market on these social relationships.

Second, fresh markets related to social relations, have a direct impact on *well-being* of people, they contribute to a greater sense of well-being and thus to public health of its users. In a research it will be identified in what sense customers and vendors experience more happiness or feel that visiting the markets raises their spirits, and compare this in how they experience this when they use (new) supermarkets.

Third, a decline of fresh markets in the city in favor of super and hypermarkets will, as we have seen for Hong Kong and Thailand, inevitably contribute to a great decline in *nutrition* by a large part of the population. It needs to be researched into what sense the fresh-market contributes to a healthy lifestyle in Hanoi. Aspects to be looked at in specific are food safety, hygiene, and the impact of consuming at supermarkets on raising illnesses as diabetic and obesity.

Fourth, impact on the *urban poor*, it needs to be researched into what extent prices differ at supermarkets, hypermarkets, shopping malls versus the fresh-market and what job opportunities exist for all the displaced sellers and the farmers whose produce they used to sell. The impact on the urban poor and into what extent does this increase to growing gap between rich and poor in Hanoi. The other way around it needs to be research into what extent the affordable foods at fresh-markets contribute to health and well-being of the urban poor.

Fifth, the *cultural way of life* and culinary culture part of fresh markets. It will be researched into what extent people perceive fresh markets as an important part of their cultural way of life. What is very important to people, what not. And into what extend are these characteristics present in the new supermarkets.

Sixth, renovating or replacing fresh markets has direct impact on the *local economy* in an area. When a market is replaced it needs to be looked at how this can be done in such a way it improves the local economy in the area, instead of what happens at present in Hanoi in which new markets (shopping malls) are destroying the local economy in areas in the city.

Research has to collect information and facts on the present situation in Hanoi, and collect views and ideas of this development by vendors, customers and local retailers in different areas.

Based on these six aspects an action plan for research will be prepared which is suggested to be conducted held in fall 2010 / winter 2011.

References

- Airey, L. 2003. "Nae as nice a scheme as it used to be": lay accounts of neighbourhood incivilities and well-being', *Health & Place*, vol 9, pp 129-37.
- Anh Quân, "Quy hoạch thương mại Hà Nội: Sẽ phát triển mạnh ra các khu vực mới", Title in English: - "Hanoi commercial planning: will expand strongly to new areas?", article published in *Vneconomy* 28/07/2009.
- Cathy Banwell, Jane Dixon, Sam-Ang Seubsman², Suttinan Pangsap, Matthew Kelly 2010. Fresh markets, a way of life and public health under threat: governance dilemmas for Thailand. Australian National University, National Centre for Epidemiology and Population Health. Working paper of the Thai Health-Risk Transition: A National Cohort Study. Retrieved at <http://nceph.anu.edu.au>
- Blaxter, M. 2004. *Health*, Cambridge: Polity Press.
- Bowling, A. 1991. *Measuring Health: A review of quality of life measurement scales*, Milton Keynes and Philadelphia: Open University Press.
- Diener, E. and Ratz. D.R. (eds) 2000. *Advances in quality of life theory and research*. London: Kluwer Academic Publishers.
- Cam Quyen 2009. "Eight million Vietnamese get food poisoning annually". Vietnam Net
- Carolyn O'Neil 2000. Vietnam's street food. CNN Travel Now. April 28, 2000.
- Dines, N. and Cattell, V. with Gesler, W., and Curtis, S. 2006. *Public Spaces, social relations and well-being in East London*. Joseph Rowntree Foundation, University of London. Policy Press, Bristol.
- D'Haese, M., Van Den Ber, M., Speelman, S., 2008. A country wide study of consumer choice for an emerging supermarket sector: A case study for Nicaragua Dev. *Policy Rev.* 26 (5), 603-615.
- Duy Tien 2009. "Vệ sinh an toàn thực phẩm - Vi phạm tràn lan" / Food safety – rampant violations . Vietnam Net 20/04/2009
- Ellaway, A., MacIntyre, S. and Kearns, A. 2001. 'Perceptions of place and health in socially contrasting

neighborhoods', *Urban Studies*, vol 38, no 12, pp 2299-318.

Esselink et al 2004:5. Markt in zicht! Results of national market research in the Netherlands 2004. I&O research for CVAH.

Figuié, M., Moustier, P., 2009. Market appeal in an emerging economy: Supermarkets and poor consumers. *Food Policy* 34 (2), 210-217.

Geertman 2010. *The Globalization of Urban Forms in Hanoi*. Report of 1 year research for the University of Neuchatel Switzerland. Part of comparative research, The Globalization of Urban Forms in Hanoi, Ouagadougou and Palermo.

Geertman & Thong 2010. "TOAN CẦU HOA VỚI KIẾN TRÚC VÀ BIỂU HIỆN VĂN HOÁ ĐÔ THỊ MỚI Ở HÀ NỘI" / "Globalization, architecture and new urban cultures in Hanoi". *Thap Thi Xay Dung /Construction Magazine*, Ministry of Construction Vietnam.

Giao Thong Van Tai, 2010. "Chợ Hà Nội, thừa và thiếu" - Báo Giao thông vận tải. / Markets in Hanoi, redundant and missing. **Published in: ?**

Girard, Paulette and Michel Cassagnes (2001), 'Khu Phố Cổ' in *Hanoi; Le cycle des metamorphoses'. Formes architecturales et urbaines*. Edited by Pierre Clément & Nathalie Lancret. Paris : Les Cahiers de l'Ipraus. pp.279-284.

Gorton, M., Sauer, J., Supatpongkul, P., 2009a. Investigating Thai Shopping Behaviour: Wet-Markets, Supermarkets and the 'Big Middle". International Assoc. Agricult. Econ. Conference, Beijing, China.

Hawkes, C., 2008. Dietary implications of supermarket development: A global perspective. *Dev.Policy Rev.* 26(6), 657-692.

Hoogerwerf 2007. "Diversiteit aan markten maakt Amsterdam tot wereldstad" / Diversity of markets makes Amsterdam a world city. City of Amsterdam. Retrieved from www.bestuursinformatie.amsterdam.nl

Hy, Nguyen, Thua (2002), *Economic History of Hanoi in the 17th, 18th and 19th Centuries*. Original version 1993, translated in 2002 by Barbara Cohen. National Political Publishing House Hanoi.

Jaibun, K., 2006. Markets and Lifestyles: A preliminary survey of literature concerning markets and Thai society, in: Chaisingkanaon, S. (Ed.), *Markets in Life and Life in Markets* Sirinthon Humanities Research Centre, Bangkok.

Kim Thai 2008. "Unwanted Alternative". *Vietnam Economic Times*, special report on fresh markets in Vietnam, page 22-23. July 2008.

Ledent, Jacques (2002), 'La population: évolution passée et développement future' in *Hanoi, Enjeux modernes d'une ville millénaire*. Edited by François Charbonneau and Do Hau. Canada: edition Trames, Faculty of Urban Planning, University of Montreal. pp. 64-87.

Le Cam Le 2008. "Never Fade Away". *Vietnam Economic Times*, special report on fresh markets in Vietnam, page 26-27. July 2008.

- Lim, L., Kjellstrom, T., Sleigh, A., Khamman, S., Seubsman, S.-A., Dixon, J., Banwell, C., 2009. Associations between urbanisation and components of the health-risk transition in Thailand. A descriptive study of 87,000 Thai adults. *Global Health Action* (DOI: 103402/gha.v52i0.1914.).
- Logan (2000), *Hanoi, Biography of a City*. Seattle: University of Washington Press,. Long, Ngo Vinh 1991. *Before the Revolution: the Vietnamese Peasants Under the French*. New York: Colombia University Press.
- Luan 1997. 'Hanoi: Balancing Market and Ideology' in *Culture and the City in East Asia*. Edited by Mike Douglas, Won Bae Kim, Sang-Chuel Choe and Kong Chong Ho. Oxford: Clarendon Press.
- Lui Sze-ki 2008. An Ethnographic Comparison of Wet Markets and Supermarkets in Hong Kong. *The Hong Kong Anthropologist*. Volume 2, 2008.
- Mann 2000. Optimizing the plant-based diet. *Asia Pacific J Clin Nutr* (2000) 9 (Suppl.): S60-S64
- Mendez, M., Popkin, B., 2004. Globalization, urbanization and nutritional change in the developing world. *Electronic Journal of Agricultural and Development Economics* 1 (2), 220-241.
- Mutebi, A., 2007. Regulatory Responses to Large-format Transnational Retail in Southeast Asian Urban Studies 44 (2), 357-379.
- Ngoisao.net, 2006. "Chợ cũ nhộn nhịp, chợ mới vắng hoe" - Ngôi sao / Old markets are bustling, new markets are completely deserted. Retrieved from: 23/4/2006.
- Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD). 2003. *Organic Agriculture: Sustainability, Markets and Politics*. Cambridge, MA: CABI Pub.
- Phe, Hoang Huu & Yukio Nishimura (1990), *The Historical Environment and Housing Conditions in the '36 Old Streets' Quarter of Hanoi*. Division of Human Settlements Development, Asian Institute of Technology.
- Popkin, B., 2003. The nutrition transition in the developing world. *Dev. Pol. Rev.* 21 581-597.
- Ritzer, George. 2000. "An Introduction to McDonaldization." In *The McDonaldization of Society*, pp. 1-20. Thousand Oaks, Calif.: Pine Forge Press.
- Schaffner, D., Bokal, B., Fink, S., Rawls, K., Schweiger, J., 2005. Food retail-price comparison in Thailand. *Journal of Food Distribution Research* 36 (1), 167- 171.
- Theo 2008." Vệ sinh an toàn thực phẩm ở nhiều chợ còn kém" / Food safety in many market is very poor. 04/08/2008. Retrieved from <http://tintuc.xalo.vn>
- Thong, Nguyen Quoc (2001), 'Histoire de Hanoi : la ville en ses quartiers'. In *Hanoi; Le cycle des metamorphoses. Formes architecturales et urbaines*. Edited by Pierre Clément & Nathalie
- Trọng Phú , 2007. '126 chợ sẽ thành... trung tâm thương mại' / 126 markets will become shopping

centers. Article published in newspaper: Báo tuổi trẻ, 2007.

Underhill, Paco 1999. *Why We Buy*. The Science of Shopping. New York: Simon & Schuster.

Van der Geest, P., 2006. Natural Markets: Remaking food and agriculture in Southeast Asia. Conference Presentation. Association of American Geographers, Chicago.

Vietnam Net 2010. Deputies address proposed Law on Food Safety. 02/06/2010.

Vietnam News 2007. Food hygiene inspections tightened. 13/08/2007.

Vinkeles Melchers, N., Gomes, M., Colaguri, R., 2009. Do socio-economic factors influence supermarket content and shoppers' purchases? *Health Prom J. Aust.* 20 (3), 241-247.