1. Executive summary

This is a final narrative report and process evaluation for the Vietnam Livable Cities (LC) Project from July 2013 to June 2014. This report is prepared by the Vietnamese LC project team with data and information collected from the reports of local partners as well as the field visit records.

In the 2013 – 2014 period, HBV’s LC team worked with five key local partners for five small projects. They are (1) Hoi An City Team for “Hoi An Park Master Plan”, (2) Action Centre for City Development for “Park Building with Community Engagement”, (3) Hue Urban Planning Institute for “Public Realm Design and Research”, (4) Hanoi Urban Architecture Company for “Active & Safe Routes to Schools” and (5) Vietnam Women Museum for Exhibition “Stories of Markets”. In addition, the Vietnamese LC project team also worked on fundraising, partnership and policy development.

Based on the goal, objectives and indicators identified for the project, the activities within the three key areas were implemented successfully. However, not all activities were completed within the project timeline and had to be move to next year for completion.

After this year of implementation, there are five key recommendations proposed for LC team to enhance the works in future:

- **Recommendation 1:** Continue the three existing components include open public spaces, safe walking routes to schools, and access to healthy foods.
- **Recommendation 2:** Work with local partners to plan the yearly activities and evaluation in detail.
- **Recommendation 3:** Make more efforts to develop a network of park building activists and support the LC coalition.
- **Recommendation 4:** Continue to provide technical comments to the development of the National Strategy on Non-communicable diseases (NCD).
- **Recommendation 5:** Increase efforts on fundraising and partnership development.

In sum, through the Vietnam LC project 2013 – 2014, the LC team contributed towards livable cities in local neighbourhoods and achieved nine expected immediate outcomes for its activities. In addition, the team had an impact on other cities where the team was not directly involved.

2. Introduction

2.1 Rationale

There has been a growing public health concern worldwide surrounding the decline in outdoor physical activities and socialisation of urban residents, particularly with respect to increased risks for non-communicable diseases. In Vietnamese cities, these health implications have resulted from a sharp decrease of open public spaces and growing motorised transportation, following the country’s rapid economic growth and urbanization over the past 20 years. In addition, the food environment in big cities is seeing a major transition, also as a result of “economic development”: supermarkets are replacing traditional food markets and the retail sector, resulting in impacts to the accessibility, availability, and affordability of both healthy and unhealthy foods.

In that context, HealthBridge Vietnam conducted several initiatives aimed at making urban neighborhoods more livable and conducive to healthy lifestyles. They included advocacy for a policy on neighborhood open
public spaces using a pilot in Hoi An city as a model, a situational assessment of how primary school children currently travel to and from schools in Hanoi and a campaign to preserve fresh markets in Hanoi.

2.2 Project goal and objectives

With the livable cities program in Vietnam we have vision, outcomes as follow:

**Vision:**
We envision healthy, happy Vietnamese living in neighbourhoods that are designed for people. We want lots of public spaces, a safe, convenient, accessible transportation system, and clean air and streets. In addition we want a safe, sufficient, reliable and nutritious food supply.

**Ultimate outcome (goal)**
Decreased NCD-related mortality and morbidity amongst urban residents in Vietnam and increased social interaction and community cohesion.

To that end, from the period 7/2013-12/2013, we focused our efforts in the three areas and expect to achieve 9 immediate outcomes as follow:

**Immediate outcomes (objectives)**

*Improving urban neighborhood open public spaces*
- #1. Increased number of safe, accessible and fun open public spaces in Hoi An and Hue
- #2. Increased number of people using and maintaining the public spaces in Hoi An and Hue
- #3. Increased awareness of policy makers and city governments on community participation in developing and managing public spaces

*Creating safe walking routes to schools for children*
- #4. Increased number of safe spaces for children to walk to school in Hanoi
- #5. Increased number of children walking to schools in Hanoi
- #6. Increased preference of walking and cycling for short trips by children and adults
- #7. Increased awareness amongst policy makers and the public on the needs of creating active safe routes to schools for children.

*Preserving urban fresh markets*
- #8. Increased awareness of policy makers and public on the importance of fresh markets in big cities.
- #9. Increased number of organizations working to preserve urban fresh markets
3. Evaluation

3.1 Progress

**Component #1: Open public spaces**

In this first component, we aimed to develop a model of building and reclaiming public spaces with the local government’s strong commitment and comprehensive public policy, the community’s participation and professionals’ expertise. We use this model to ultimately advocate for a policy on neighborhood open public spaces at the central level. To that aim, from now until 2015 we are supporting a city team of the Hoi An Government to develop a Master Plan on Public Space Development. This year’s activities focused on conducting baseline research and public space inventories in the city. We also supported the Action Centre for City Development (ACCD) to reclaim an unused piece of land to developing a park with an expectation that the documented experience and lessons learned will be supportive to the Master Plan development. In addition to Hoi An, we are also working in Hue where we are supporting the Hue Urban Planning Institute (HUPI) to develop a design of a public realm (Nguyen Dinh Chieu Street) with community participation. This design and its recommendations will be advocacy materials for public spaces development in Hue in next coming years.

**Table 1: Evaluation for component #1 - Open Public Spaces**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>#</th>
<th>Activities</th>
<th>Indicators (as stated in the proposal)</th>
<th>Indicators (achieved)</th>
<th>Evaluations/ Outcome</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Development of Hoi An’s Park Master Plan</td>
<td></td>
<td>There was a proposal with detailed work plan and budget for the development of the park master plan. We used the proposal and work plan as a basis to sign the contract with city team.</td>
<td>This activity was done with good quality but took longer time than expected. Through this work, a partnership between HBV and Hoi An Government was set up for preparation of the PS master plan. The city Government committed to and launched the development of the master plan. This will lead to improved public spaces.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Develop a work plan for the PS master plan in Hoi An</td>
<td>• 1 proposal for PS development developed</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| 2  | Conduct audit and inventory for PS in Hoian | • # tool developed  
• # & % questionnaires returned  
• # PS examined  
• 1 audit and inventory report developed  | • There were 2 tools developed for this activity: one was for audit by observation and other for collection of secondary data from city’s dept.  
• There were 120 audit questionnaires filled by observers.  
• 100% of the existing PS (120 sites) in Hoian were examined.  
• Finally, an audit and inventory report developed by city team in 2014 | This activity was implemented with good quality and timeframe. Through this work, the understanding of city team and partners about current condition of the existing PS in Hoi An was increased. The audit and inventory information will be the input for the development of the master plan |
| 3  | Conducted a survey of the residents’ needs for PS in Hoi An | • # tool developed  
• # & % questionnaires returned  
• # people interviewed  
• 1 needs assessment report developed  | There was 1 user survey tool developed. There were 520 questionnaires distributed for interviews and 100% were returned. There were 520 users interviewed. Finally, a needs assessment report was developed by the city team in Jun, 2014. | This activity was implemented with good quality and timeframe. Through this activity, the understanding of city team and partners about the residents’ needs and expectation on PS was increased. The needs assessment will be the input for the development of the master plan |
| 4  | Provide technical advice to the city team | • # field visits to monitor and provide technical support  
• # meetings with the city team to get update information and provide them with technical advice  
• # phone calls/email discussions between the SPO and the coordinator of the city team about the project implementation  | There were 1 fieldtrip by the Program Director and 4 trips by Senior Project Officer (SPO) to Hoi An for monitoring and technical support. There were 5 meetings both formal and informal with the city team to get update information and provide them with technical advice. There were regular phone calls and email discussions between the SPO and the coordinator of the city team about the project implementation. | This activity was implemented perfectly. The capacity of the team members to conduct the inventories and research was improved. The collaboration between HBV’s LC team and the local partner was strengthened. Then the city team will implement the inventories and the baseline research better. |
<p>| 5  | Advocate the local government to approve the | • # meetings with the leaders of city  | 5 informal meetings with the leaders of Hoi An’s People | This activity was implemented with good timeframe. It resulted in |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Development of a new park</th>
<th>• 1 new park approved for development</th>
<th>Committee and the Department of Urban management on a proposal to develop the unused land into a park organized. 1 abandoned space area of Cam Chau Blind Association in Hoi An was approved to build a new park for the city.</th>
<th>Improved awareness of the city leaders that the unused area in city is a good source of land for park development. Then the city Government support to development of PS from abandoned spaces in the city. Hoi An People’s Committee issued Decision No. 1857/UBND approving the development of the unused land area of the Cam Chau Blind Association into a park.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Work with the local government (the People’s Committee (PC) of Cam Chau Ward) on the plan to develop the unused land area into a park (land conflict, park design and fundraising)</td>
<td>• # meetings with PC and ward representative  • 1 workplan developed</td>
<td>Weekly meetings with Cam Chau ward to clarify the plan for development the park in this ward. A workplan between ACCD and Cam Chau ward was developed to clarify the tasks and responsibility of each side. This activity was implemented with good timeframe and results. It resulted in increased support of the ward PC for the development of the park. The awareness of Hoi An’s leaders about the needs for neighborhood parks was increased.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Design charrette for park in Hoian</td>
<td>• # field visits  • # meetings with local community for their participation  • #meeting with Hoian PC to get feedback about park design  • # of designs</td>
<td>More than 10 site visits to observe the situation of Cam Chau park. Four meetings with local community (mainly about informing the plan to reclaim the land for park building and resolving conflicts with the households who took the land for private use). There was a meeting with Hoi An People’s Committee to get feedback about park design 3 design proposals and one were selected with cost estimations prepared. This activity was implemented with good quality but took longer time than expected due to interest conflicts between the resident groups. The residents’ awareness about abandoned public land in their neighborhood and urban design process was increased. The awareness of community on their needs in terms of space to play, relax, meet and exercise was increased. The understanding of residents about park design process with public participation was increased. The design team learnt more about the process of listening to different stakeholders (residents,</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Activity Description</th>
<th>Details</th>
<th>Notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Construct a park with community participation</td>
<td>- 1 park constructed&lt;br&gt;- # VND or in-kind time contributed for park&lt;br&gt;- # people this park can served&lt;br&gt;- # &amp; % of people used park</td>
<td>The earth work at Cam Chau park was started. But the construction was not finished. Cam Chau ward’s PC committed to contribute 300 million VND (including earth work costs) to the park construction. This money and in-kind contributions is 37.5% of the total investment (800 millions) of this park.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>This activity started on June 27 and was delayed from what was originally stated in the plan. ACCD plans to finish this work by the end of 2014. Once this activity is finished, the number of park in Hoi An will be increased.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Research to design a public realm in Hue

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Activity Description</th>
<th>Details</th>
<th>Notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Develop the research protocol and sign contract for development of study on design a public realm with community participation in Hue</td>
<td>- 1 research protocol developed&lt;br&gt;- 1 contract signed</td>
<td>There is 1 research protocol developed by HUPI in August 2013. Based on this protocol HBV signed a contract with HUPI for activities in 2013 - 2014</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>This activity was finished with appropriated timeframe and a contract between HBV and HUPI was signed on 30th August 2013. With this activity, resources were ready for the research.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Conduct field survey and situational assessment</td>
<td>- # tool developed&lt;br&gt;- # public spaces examined&lt;br&gt;- # people interviewed&lt;br&gt;- # meetings with city leaders and professionals organized&lt;br&gt;- 1 situation assessment report developed</td>
<td>There were two tools developed, one was the audit tool and the other was the user survey tool. HUPI implemented an observation at Nguyen Dinh Chieu (NDC) street. There were 100 people interviewed about their needs and opinions on the PS. There were two meetings with Hue province leaders and professionals in the city to discuss about the current status of NDC street. 5 leaders, 6 professionals and 3 businesses filled in the</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>This activity was delayed at least 1 month. It helped to improved understanding of the research team about the current situation of the study site and resident needs. This will be the input for developing the design proposal.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#</td>
<td>Activity Description</td>
<td>Details</td>
<td>Notes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>----------------------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>-------</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| 11 | Develop a design for Nguyen Dinh Chieu public realm | • # design proposals developed  
• 1 final design selected for final report  
• # recommendations developed | A draft design was developed and it would be revised after the consultation.  
There were six recommendations to redevelop NDC street into a public realm.  
This activity was finished and ready for public consultation.  
The recommendations will be apart of arguments for policy advocacy for public space development in Hue in the future. |
| 12 | Develop draft final report and recommendations for Nguyen Dinh Chieu public realm | • 1 draft report developed | A draft report was developed and sent to city leaders and professionals for consultation. |
| 13 | Organize consultation meetings with community and professionals for design and report | • # consultation meetings organized  
• # people participated in meetings  
• # comments for the report and design | A meeting to consult about the plan and design of NDC public realm was organized.  
30 participants including representatives of local government officers, local professionals and local community.  
The SPO also commented on the draft report  
The draft report was improved with comments from the participants, including representatives of the community. This leads to increase the public participation in planning public spaces for user’s needs. |
| 14 | Revise final report and recommendations for Nguyen Dinh Chieu public realm | • 1 final report revised  
• # & % comments included | A final report finished  
HUPI planned to use the recommendations to advocate and share the learned lessons to other cities. This is a important point which both HBV and HUPI have to make more efforts in the future. |
Component #2: Active and safe walking routes to schools (ASRTS)

In this second component, we planned to organize active and safe routes to school for students at Ha Dinh primary school in Hanoi in two years 2013 – 2015 with an expectation that this pilot would provide the evidence needed for advocating for policies to encourage active transport among students in Hanoi. We were working with a group of volunteer architects including lecturers from the Universities of Architecture, Construction, and Phuong Dong to pilot the program. The manager of the pilot and team leader was Mr. Tran Huy Anh, a well-known architect who is very active in advocating for urban development policies and experienced in working with local communities. In Jun 2013 – Jul 2014, the team conducted a needs assessment and walkability observation. From the results of surveys, we engaged the community to identify routes for intervention. HBV and the pilot team plans to work with local community, school and other partners to organize the first pilot route at the beginning of school year 2014 – 2015.

Table 2: Evaluation for component #2 - Active and safe walking routes to schools (ASRTS)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>#</th>
<th>Activities</th>
<th>Indicators (as stated in the proposal)</th>
<th>Indicators (achieved)</th>
<th>Evaluations/ outcome</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 1 | Build capacity for the team running the pilot | • # meetings with pilot team  
• # advice and sharing experience  
• # training for research skills | There were 2 meetings to update the pilot progress and provide the project team with comments and advice.  
There were 3 presentations about project management and international experience on ASRTS.  
HBV also organized a training for survey team on development of data entry form and data analysis (because the team was architects and were not familiar with quantitative analysis skills) | This activity was finished with good quality and time frame.  
The capacity of the team in conducting the situational survey as well as the project management was improved. This helped to have better results of the situational survey as well as the project management. |
| 2 | Conduct the situational analysis | • # neighborhoods examined for walkability  
• # parents interviewed  
• # children interviewed  
• # routes identified  
• 1 report developed | There was a study about the street network of whole area of Ha Dinh ward then walkability study at service area of Ha Dinh primary schools (within comfortable distance for walking), and a self-administered survey with 800 parents of Ha Dinh school. | This activity was finished but took longer time than expected.  
The project team’s understanding of the field and transportation situation around Ha Dinh schools was increased. Their understanding on challenges/ opportunities for piloting the |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>8 main walking routes to the school from the 8 residential areas in Ha Dinh were identified. A situational analysis report about walking to school in Ha Dinh was developed in April 2014.</th>
<th>ASRTS in Ha Dinh ward was also improved. There was better understanding of the travel habits to the school and demands of the school children and their parents. The survey results were used for the intervention to create safe routes for children to walk to school.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Conduct meetings with local authorities to gain their supports and inform them of the preliminary results of the surveys: • # meetings organized • # leaders attended meeting and who</td>
<td>5 meetings with the local authorities in Ha Dinh to gain their support and inform them of the preliminary results of the survey. There was a meeting with stakeholders and the community in Ha Dinh to share international experience about ASRTS and importance of walking to school for children. More than ten leaders of ward’s PC, neighborhoods leaders, school board’s member attended the meetings. The support from local authorities for ASRTS was increased. The local authorities agreed to pilot creating a route for children to walk to school in the Ha Dinh ward. They introduced the team to work with the local school (Ha Dinh) to do the survey with parents and in-depth interviews with primary school students.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Develop designs to improve walking routes to school for children • # routes proposed • # design proposals developed</td>
<td>4 designing options to improve 04 walking routes to school for children developed. The options were displayed at the schools and on the Ha Dinh website to get comments from teachers, parents, community and local authorities. This activity was completed with support of volunteer architects and students. With this activity, the feasibility of the pilot ASRTS was increased.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Organize a community meeting to select a pilot route of safe walking to schools. • # consultation meetings organized • # routes selected for implementation</td>
<td>One consultation meeting was organized to select the most appropriate route for intervention. Finally a route is selected from 4 proposed routes. This activity was completed with good timeframe and results. The collaboration between different stakeholders and the community in managing the pilot walking route was increased. This lead to a better management of the pilot walking route and increased the community’s attention to the pilot</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#</td>
<td>Activity Description</td>
<td># points upgraded</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Physical intervention to improve the walking route to school</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Organize event “walking to school”</td>
<td>1 event organized</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Establish the self-management team of the route and develop regulations on management of the walking route</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Component #3: Saving fresh markets

This component was continuous from the previous years’ efforts to counter the policy to close/replace markets with commercial centers. In the 2013 – 2014 period, we worked with Vietnam Women Museum and Fresh Studio to organize an exhibition for traditional markets in Hanoi. The exhibition was opened in March 2014 and attracted attention of the public, media and local authorities in Hanoi. In addition, we also produced a documentary to highlight importance of fresh markets to Hanoi residents. This video is expected to be an advocacy tool for our saving the markets campaign in next stage.

Table 3: Evaluation for component #3 - Saving fresh markets

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>#</th>
<th>Activities</th>
<th>Indicators (as stated in the proposal)</th>
<th>Indicators (achieved)</th>
<th>Evaluations/ outcome</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Saving market campaign</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Develop a MoU and a plan for exhibition on fresh markets in Hanoi</td>
<td>• 1 MoU signed</td>
<td>An MoU between HBV and VWM signed. This MoU clarified the exhibition plan with inputs from HB, VWM and Fresh Studio</td>
<td>This activity was finished with good timeframe. The partnership between HB, VWM and Fresh Studio was created. We were able to increase the number of organizations (Fresh Studio ad VWM) involved in the saving fresh market campaign</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Collect materials for the exhibition (the available research and photos of HB and FS, additional photos and interviews)</td>
<td>• # secondary data/materials collected • # new data/materials collected</td>
<td>Materials for the exhibition (the available research and photos from HB and FS, additional photos and 28 interviews) were collected. This was the key to the success of the exhibition.</td>
<td>This activity was completed with good quality and timeframe. The materials for the exhibition with real stories to convey the arguments of the exhibition “markets have been and will still be an essential part of the city” was increased. The awareness of policy makers and the public about the roles increased, importance of fresh markets and increased their willingness to preserve and develop fresh markets.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Organize the exhibition opening, press meeting</td>
<td>• 1 exhibition organized • 1 opening event organized</td>
<td>The exhibition opening was</td>
<td>This activity was completed with good quality and timeframe.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
and conduct follow-up media activities

- # guests at the event
- 1 press meeting organized
- # reporters participated
- # articles and other media programs reported
- # VND or in-kind contributed by partners

organized with 300 guests.

One press meeting was organized with 40 reporters.

There were 76 online and printed media articles, 9 TV reportages about the exhibition produced.

Over one month of the exhibition, there were over 10,000 visitors and 465 comments and feedbacks. Most of the comments presented that market not only presented Vietnamese’s traditional and cultural values but also were essential for daily life of dwellers.

The public and media attention to markets issues was increased.

The understanding of exhibition’s visitors about importance of traditional markets was increased as well.

Finalize the video highlighting values of markets in the life of urban residents and play at “Stories of markets” exhibition

- 1 documentary produced
- # screenings at market exhibition organized

A documentary on Hanoi markets was produced.

The video was shown at the exhibition for one month.

This activity was completed with acceptable quality and timeframe. With this film, the visual materials on values of markets were increased.

Fundraising and Program/ Partnerships Development

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>#</th>
<th>Activities</th>
<th>Indicators</th>
<th>Evaluation/ Outcomes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 1 | Present HB’s success story in mobilizing multi-sectoral stakeholders to the Saving Unification Park Campaign at a training course of the Hanoi School of Public Health (HSPH). Discussion with the participants on why LC also a health issue | • 30 participants including junior officers from the Ministry of Education, Ministry of Health, Ministry of Labor, Invalids and Social Affairs, Medical University, Youth Union…
• 03 lecturers (including the Vice Dean) of the HSPH Health Promotion Faculty | Increased knowledge of the HSPH lecturers and the participants about the HBV past and present efforts on the subject of LC and the link between LC and NCD prevention. |
<p>| 2 | Follow up with IDRC proposal | • Follow-up emails with Greg and budget revisions as he requested. | Improved opportunities for future funding and collaboration (The proposal was rejected but the team has agreed to keep working |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Activity Description</th>
<th>Outcome</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Participated in the core group to establish the Coalition for Livable Cities (CLC) in Vietnam:</td>
<td>• HB inputs to a strategy for CLC, which VUPDA developed and submitted to Oxfam for funding. Tightened HB relations with the network of individuals/organizations interested in developing LC in Vietnam.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Developed a concept note on preserving neighborhood public spaces in Hanoi and submitted it to Oxfam (as an issue-based project under the CLC proposal by VUPDA) and the Asia Foundation.</td>
<td>• 01 proposal and concept note to Oxfam • 01 concept note to Asia foundation The proposal by VUPDA was rejected by Oxfam, then the concept note was not considered for funding. The concept note was accepted by the Asia foundation.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Developed a concept note “Safer Roads: Protecting Vulnerable Road Users in Vietnam and sent it to the Global Safe Roads Programme.</td>
<td>• 01 concept note to Global Safe Roads Programme developed Improved opportunities for funding. The concept note was rejected.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Improved UDA/VUF-HB relations to promote LC in Vietnam -</td>
<td>• A MoU to promote LC in Vietnam • 02 Meetings between HB and UDA leaders • A three-year workplan to promote LC in Vietnam Strengthened relationship with UDA/VUF – MOC. Commitment from UDA/VUF to promote LC in Vietnam.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Provided technical comments to the development of the National Strategy on Non-communicable diseases: focusing on creating enabling environment for physical activities and access to healthy food</td>
<td>• 03 meeting with NCD team participated by HBV. Better content of the national strategy relating to enabling environment for physical activities and access to healthy food. Increased multi-sectoral strategies on enabling environment for physical activities and access to healthy food in the National Strategy on NCDs. The Ministries of Construction and Transportation were involved in developing the Strategy.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
3.2 Significant changes to the project

There were some delays with starting the implementation of the projects in Hoi An, Hue as well as the pilot of ASRTS in Ha Dinh (Hanoi). Some internal and external reasons were cited for these delays.

As of internal reasons, there were the long discussions between HBV and local partners to develop the most feasible and appropriate workplan and timeline. Then, the work in Hoi An and Hue was started in late October while the contract dates were 31st August. For the Pilot of ASRTS in Ha Dinh, though the project was launched on time, there were human resource changes in the volunteer group, creating difficulties for the team leader to keep the pilot activities run as planned. In addition, the scope of this work was extended sometimes by the management of Mr. Anh from HAUC. This is the result of enthusiasm and passion in this work of Mr. Anh. He could easily make the project bigger and longer in comparison with what we planned at the beginning.

Regarding external reasons, two big typhoons came to the central region in late Oct and early Nov, which delayed the activities by our partners. They had to concentrate their efforts on fighting against the typhoons and mitigate the consequences.

There were a number of unfinished activities by the close of the project. Because most of the project components will be continued in the next project, these unfinished activities will be moved to next year’s plan.

Component #1

- The development of the Public Spaces Master Plan in Hoi An: The inventories and need survey have been finished with concise reports as inputs for the master planning. However, consultative meetings with experts and communities and development of the draft Public space development strategy have not been conducted due to the time shortage (due to the delayed start and the interruption by the big typhoon in 2013).
- The pilot of reclaiming abandoned land for construction of a park:
  - The significant change is the delay of the construction of the park due to land conflict. There are families who took the land of the park for private use. This caused a delay for the city and the Cam Chau ward’s authorities to take legal actions and to negotiate with local residents. The city government had to establish a negotiation working group to tell the residents about the importance of park for their community and convince the households who occupied the land to return it for park building.
  - Due to the land conflict, it was impossible to organize a community-wide charrette. Instead we organized 4 meetings with 4 residents’ groups to learn about the conflict, to work through the dynamics and to get residents’ opinions about the park project.
  - The original plan was to build the park in phases, because the project funding is limited. However the residents and local authorities strongly asked not to build in phases and therefore the funding for the park became an issue. This was also a reason for the delay of construction. Finally, all partners have decided to adjust the design of the park thus reduce the cost for construction to an affordable budget. ACCD planned to finish construction work of Cam Chau park in October 2014.

Component #2

- Active safe route to schools:
  - The survey with students and parents took longer in part because the team used a larger number of samples. Moreover, the researcher, who was an architect, seemed unfamiliar with quantitative analysis skills. Therefore it took time for us to provide her with training and build her capacity on this matter.
  - By the end of the project, the field survey, students and parent survey and physical intervention to improve one walking route to school were completed but much later than the plan. Therefore, we did not have much time for the pilot organization of the children to walk to school. This activity together with evaluation of the pilot will be conducted in the next project.

3.3 Sustainability of results:
- The pilot of community engagement in building and maintaining parks and playgrounds in Hoi An continued to be a successful model and is inspiring groups in other cities to follow. So far, groups in seven cities and provinces including Hanoi, Da Nang, Nha Trang, HCM City, Phu Quoc, Thai Nguyen and Nam Dinh have come to Hoi An to learn about the model and apply the approach in building parks and playgrounds in their own communities.
- Though the pilot ASRTS was not finished, there were positive signs that the community and schools were very interested and actively involved in the program. However, there is a need for an evaluation of the intervention to see if the approach is appropriate and should be scaled up in Hanoi.
- With our technical support to the local partners, their capacity, awareness and commitment to LC issues have been improved very much:
  - ACCD have become more committed to the development of public spaces. They have been able to advise the city government on the issue and provide support to groups in other cities that want to build parks/ playgrounds with community engagement. ACCD recently decided to expand their program to development of beach parks and safe walking routes to public spaces.
  - The group of volunteer architects and students involved in ASRTS pilot in Hanoi has learned more about quantitative research skills. The pilot team leader learned about project management, planning skills and how to engage community, authorities and schools in the project from the beginning.
  - The research skills of the city team in Hoi An have been improved very much. They have also had experience in multi-collaboration to do the master plan on the public spaces.
  - The research report on improvement of Nguyen Dinh Chieu street into a public realm has become an important input for the HPI to comment on the city’s detailed plan of the two sides of Huong River.

3.4 Learned lessons

- Some of our new local partners (the HPI, Hoi An Department of Culture and Information and Mr. Anh) lacked experience in project management in general and writing reports in particular. So the project team should provide them with support and appropriate training related this issue. We should assess the capacity of future organizations at the beginning of a project and undertake training as required. This will help keep projects on time.
- Due to distance working with partners, the communication is rather weak. Therefore, it was rather difficult to follow up with their progress and keep them from being distracted from the committed plan by other duties. For example, after the meeting between the PD, SPO and Director of HPI, it was agreed that they should define the design requirements (what kind of goods will be sold?) for this commercial pedestrian street before starting the design tasks. Unfortunately, until design stage HPI has not taken any action to clarify this. To overcome this challenge, the project team suggested that these partners report their work every month. The report form should be very simple and list out challenges need our support or revisions need our approval.
- To be sure that our current work with Hoi An will be used for development of the PS strategy as well as to get long-term commitment from the Hoi An government to collaborate with us in this work, it is recommended that HBV should sign an MoU with Hoi An for 3-year collaboration between the two parties on this field.
- Turning abandoned urban land into parks is a complicated process. We did not foresee the risk of community conflict, and therefore the project was delayed.
- The plan to set up a coalition for Livable cities in Vietnam has collapsed (as the proposal was rejected by Oxfam). We need to consider any opportunity to set up a similar coalition, and determine if we should play the role as initiating/coordinating a similar network.

4. Recommendations

Recommendation 1: The LC project’s team in Vietnam should continue with the three existing components: (1) parks, playgrounds and plazas, (2) safe walking routes to schools and (3) access to healthy foods (preservation and development of market places) with continuous activities from this year 2014 - 2015.
Recommendation 2: To prevent the delays of project activities, the project team should work with local partners to plan the yearly activities in details and specify the monitoring mechanism of tasks in the contract for each component.

Recommendation 3: To replicate the LC concept in Vietnam then lead to greater impact of project to society, LC project’s team should continue make more efforts to support a PS network of grassroots activists, professionals, volunteers, local philanthropists to develop neighborhood low cost playgrounds for children in 2014 - 2015: This network could be a part of LC network in Vietnam in future.

Recommendation 4: Toward ultimate outcome of the project, as a part of long-term strategy the LC project’s team should continue to provide technical comments to the development of the National Strategy on Non-communicable diseases with a focus on creating enabling environment for physical activities and access to healthy food.

Recommendation 5: To get more resources for activities and extend the LC concept in Vietnam, the LC project’s team should increase efforts on fundraising and partnership development by preparing a fundraising workplan and implement it in next coming years.