

# **Livable Cities Project Vietnam**

**Final Report**

**1/7/2015 – 30/6/2016**

## **Final Technical Report:**

Project: Livable Cities Project Vietnam

By HealthBridge Vietnam

Reporting period: 1/7/2015-1/6/2016

This final technical report and process evaluation for the Vietnam Livable Cities (LC) Project is for the period from July 2015 to Jun 2016. The report was prepared by the Vietnamese LC team with data and information collected from the reports of local partners as well as the field visit records.

In the past year, HBV's LC team worked with four key local partners on four small projects. They are (1) Hanoi Old Quarter Management Board for research on public spaces in Hoan Kiem district, (2) Think Playgrounds for the development of "Low-cost playgrounds", (3) Hanoi Urban Architecture Company for "Active & Safe Routes to Schools", and (4) the Sport for All Department under the Ministry of Sport, Culture and Tourism to advocate for an approval of a plan to encourage physical activities in the implementation of the National Strategy on NCD prevention. In addition, the Vietnamese LC project team worked on fundraising, and partnership development and began working with the People Committee of Hue city to prepare for the development of a strategic plan on public space development in the city.

## **1. Introduction**

The Livable Cities project in 2015-16 conducted by HealthBridge in Vietnam is aimed at making urban neighborhoods more livable and conducive to healthy lifestyles. The project is comprised of: the development of a model of planning neighborhood parks at the district level in Hanoi; support to initiatives to build low-cost playgrounds in Hanoi's neighborhoods; a pilot of active safe routes to school in Hanoi; a situational analysis research on public spaces in Hue city; advocacy for a project to promote physical activities in prevention of NCD; and, for HABITAT III commitments related to active transportation, markets and public spaces.

With the livable cities program in Vietnam we have a vision and outcomes as follow:

### **Vision:**

We envision healthy, happy people living in cities with lots of fun and safe public spaces where people feel attached to their neighborhoods and neighbors; we envision cities where people can walk and cycle easily with accessible public transit; we envision cities where people have healthy and nutritious food; and we envision neighborhoods that are designed to honor our traditional culture of daily life.

### **Ultimate outcome (goal)**

Decreased NCD-related mortality and morbidity amongst urban residents in Vietnam and increased social interaction and community cohesion.

To that end, from the period 7/2015-12/2015, we focused our efforts in four areas and expect to achieve 11 immediate outcomes as follow:

### **Immediate outcomes (objectives)**

#### ***Improving urban neighborhood open public spaces***

- #1. Increased number of pilot low-cost playgrounds created under the support of project
- #2. Increased number of plans that improve public spaces in Vietnamese cities developed under the impact of project.

#### ***Creating safe walking and biking routes***

- #3. Increased number of children walking daily to Ha Dinh school (compared to the similar number in the report of the previous year)

- #4. Increased number of plans/ policies to support/ create safe walking routes to school in Ha Dinh ward.
- #5. Increased number of our articles/ papers/ presentations on walkability and cyclability in Hoi An
- #6. Increased number of Hoi An's departments participating in the development of active transportation in Hoi An

***Preserving urban fresh markets***

- #7. Increased number of our papers, articles, presentations showing changes in understanding about best practices from other countries

***Advocacy for policies to create favorable urban environment for prevention of non-communicable diseases***

- #8. Increased number of policies that create an enabling environment for physical activities and access to healthy food
- #9. Increased number of statements, presentations, articles showing changes in awareness of Vietnamese representatives.

## 2. Evaluation

### 2.1 Progress evaluation

#### **Component #1: Parks, Playgrounds and plazas**

We completed research of public gardens in Hoan Kiem district in the center of Hanoi and made recommendations to the district government to revitalize and improve the management of these public gardens. At the ward level, we finished a survey of five neighborhood public spaces in Chuong Duong ward to support the ward authorities to improve these neighborhood public spaces. Based on the survey results, we worked with Think Playgrounds (TPG) volunteer group to develop designing options to renovate the public spaces. During the project period, the project team was also successful in advocating the government of Hue city to commit to development of a park master plan for the city. This prepared the ground for the public space survey in Hue in 2016-2017.

**Table 1: Evaluation for component #1 - Open Public Spaces**

#	Expected outcomes	Activities	Reach/ Results	Evaluations/ Outcomes
1	<b>Increased number of pilot projects to create low-cost, safe and fun mobile parks/ playgrounds</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Conducted a field survey in Chuong Duong to develop a plan to revitalize five public spaces in the ward using HB's park audit tools.</li> <li>Five public spaces in the old apartment buildings of Chuong Duong ward were surveyed for potentials to develop low-cost mobile parks/ playgrounds</li> <li>A meeting with the people's committee of Chuong Duong ward to obtain their support for a public space survey</li> <li>Two meetings with representatives of the communities were organized to discuss about needs of users and potentials of public spaces development.</li> <li>Design options created to renovate the five public spaces.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Support and commitment from the ward authorities to the renovation of the public spaces.</li> <li>Better understanding of the team and local authorities about the potential to develop neighborhood public spaces in the old apartment buildings of the ward.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Chuong Duong ward has a plan to redevelop their public spaces with a vision to create accessible and inclusive playgrounds and sport grounds under good maintenance and management. The pilot implementation of the plan is expected to be carried out in 2016-17.</li> </ul>

#	Expected outcomes	Activities	Reach/ Results	Evaluations/ Outcomes
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Fixed/upgraded the play equipment and handed over the Playstreet in the Old Quarter of Hanoi to the local authorities</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Increased local capacity to manage the Playstreet</li> <li>About 500 children and parents play at the Playstreet which is organized every Saturday night in the Old Quarter.</li> </ul>	Project has been sustained by the local authorities.
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Collaborated with Think Playgrounds and Playgrounds Ideas to develop a pilot plan to renovate a public space in Nai Hien Dong commune (Da Nang city). The plan focused on mobilize community participation and local resources to transforming a dumpsite into a neighborhood park</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Increased understanding of HB and TPG about necessary activities to implement the pilot next year.</li> <li>Increased local and international awareness about HB and TPG work and collaboration.</li> </ul>	The plan won the challenge to make the city of Da Nang more livable (The challenge was organized by Citimart, 100 Resilient Cities and Da Nang People's Committee: <a href="http://citymart.squarespace.com/100rc/socialcohesion/danang#landing">http://citymart.squarespace.com/100rc/socialcohesion/danang#landing</a> ). The pilot implementation will be commenced next year if the team can mobilized sufficient budget.
2	<b>Increased number of plans for the improvement of public spaces in Vietnamese cities</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Conducted research of public gardens in Hoan Kiem district (Hanoi) for development of an improvement plan</li> <li>A field survey of 12 public gardens in the district.</li> <li>An adapted public garden audit tool and interview questionnaires</li> <li>A presentation of the preliminary findings was presented at the Management of Old Quarter and at the District People's Committee to get their comments</li> <li>A research report of the</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Interviews with 216 public gardens users and 96 residents</li> <li>Better understanding of the team about the current situation and potentials to improve the public gardens in Hoan Kiem district.</li> <li>Increased understanding and commitment of the local authorities about developing accessible and inclusive public spaces in Hoan Kiem district.</li> </ul>	<p>The local authorities used the recommendations to revitalizing their public gardens. The People's Committee of Hoan Kiem district decided to improve the infrastructures of the 13 public gardens. In total 150,000 residents in the districts will benefit from the infrastructure improvement of the garden.</p> <p>The district's People Committee also invited HealthBridge to comment to their improvement plan.</p>

#	Expected outcomes	Activities	Reach/ Results	Evaluations/ Outcomes
		current situation of the public gardens and recommendations for improving them was completed.		
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Sent an official document to the People's Committee of Hue City recommending the development of a Park master plan and offering technical support</li> <li>- A meeting with Chairman of Hue city and competent city officials to present them about the importance of a city park master plan and share Hoi An's experience.</li> <li>- A meeting with leaders of Hue city to discuss about establishing a working group for the development of the park master plan. After that, the project manager had a meeting with Chairman of Thua Thien Hue province to report him about the project.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Reach the Hue city Government and Thua Thien Hue Province's chairman</li> <li>- The People's Committee of Hue city issued an official document dated June 15<sup>th</sup> on the collaboration to develop the Park master plan and requested a workplan for the implementation.</li> <li>- Increased commitment from Hue city Government and support from the Chairman of Thua Thien Hue province for the development of the Park Master Plan. This laid the ground for the development of the plan to be carried out next year.</li> </ul>	Commencement of the plan will begin in the 2016/2017 year.

The outcomes from activities conducted in 2015-16 have contributed to the LC program reaching the intermediate outcomes of the public component on parks, playgrounds and plazas in 2014-16.

Intermediate outcomes	Reach/ Results	Evaluation
<p>Increased number of safe accessible and fun parks, playgrounds and plazas in Vietnamese Cities.</p> <p>Increased infrastructure changes that support recreation opportunities for children, girls and seniors.</p>	<p>Hoi An city: 120 existing PS will be improved and 79 new PS will be built from 2015 to 2020 according to the Hoi An Park Master Plan which were developed with HB support. As a result, each of 120,000 Hoian's dwellers will have at least one</p>	<p>The program has increased the number of parks and playground in the two cities of Hanoi and Hue. These efforts can be expanded to other cities in Vietnam in the future, (eg. Hoi An's experience can be introduced to other city</p>

	<p>square meter of neighbourhood PS within the distance of four hundreds meters from home In 2015-2016, seventeen parks were built and upgraded.</p> <p>Hanoi: A neighborhood playground and a weekend playstreet were built with our support, benefiting 700 kids and their parents every Saturday night. Hanoi will build more than 100 new neighborhood parks and playgrounds from 2016 as decided by the People's Committee of Hanoi. This resulted from our neighborhood parks campaign in 2014-15. All residents of Hanoi, especially children and old people will benefit from this plan.</p>	<p>governments) while it is necessary to follow up with technical support to the implementation of the plans in Hanoi and Hoi An.</p>
--	--	---

**Component #2: Creating safe walking and biking routes**

In this second component, we continued the third year of the pilot on organizing active safe routes to school for primary students in Ha Dinh ward. We continue to work with our local partner, Mr Tran Huy Anh to implement the pilot, which we expect to bring back evidence needed for advocating for policies to encourage active transport among students in Hanoi.

We planned to conduct a walking survey in Hoi An within this year. However, during the reporting period we were able to establish a partnership with EMBARQ/ the World Resource Institute (and receive their funding) to implement a project to improve safe pedestrian access to BRT system in HCM City. We then decided to delay the walking survey until 2016/2017.

**Table 2: Evaluation for component #2 – Creating safe walking and biking routes**

#	Expected Outcomes	Activities	Reach/ results	Evaluations/ outcomes
4	Increased number of primary school children walking safely to schools in Ha Dinh ward, Hanoi	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Developed an action plan to implement the year 3 of the pilot</li> <li>The action plan was developed with participation of the Management Board of the school, the ward's people</li> </ul>	Improved awareness of the participants about the pilot plan.	

#	Expected Outcomes	Activities	Reach/ results	Evaluations/ outcomes
		committee, the ward's fatherland front committee, and representatives of parents.		
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Implemented the action plan from Jan to May 2016:</li> <li>- Printed and distributed 100 copies of leaflets about ASRTS to parents, teachers and local authorities</li> <li>- Five monthly reports about the pilot implementation.</li> <li>•</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- 4 walking routes to schools (with physical improvements) were maintained in five months:</li> <li>Route 1: 400m</li> <li>Route 2: 150m</li> <li>Route 3: 200m</li> <li>Route 4: 300m</li> <li>- 2 online articles about the pilot</li> <li>Increased understanding of parents, teachers and local authorities about ASRTS and its benefits</li> <li>Increased public awareness about the pilot implementation.</li> </ul>	There were 120 children walking to school and 60 children biking to school, compared to 40 children walking and biking to school before the pilot.

The outcomes from activities conducted in 2015-16 have contributed to the LC program reaching the intermediate outcomes of the public component on healthy transportation in 2014-16.

Intermediate outcomes:	Reach/ results	Evaluation
Increased number of people that walk, cycle and use public transit.	A pilot of active safe route to school in Ha Dinh ward, Hanoi created four safe walking routes to Ha Dinh primary school. There are now 120 children walking to school and 60 children biking to school, compared to 40 children walking and	The pilot has increased the number of children walking and cycling in Hanoi, improved awareness of parents and local people about the need to have children walking to schools, improved support and commitment from the



	biking to school before the pilot.	school, media, and local government to the ASRTS pilot. In the future, we will follow up with maintaining the walking routes to school to encourage more children walking and cycling.
--	------------------------------------	--

**Component #3: Saving fresh markets**

During the reporting period, this component sought to increase understanding about the policy to support the development of local fresh markets in Hanoi.

**Table 3: Evaluation for component #3 - Saving fresh markets**

#	Expected outcomes	Activities	Results/ Reached	Evaluations/ outcome
<b>Saving market campaign</b>				
8	Increased papers, articles, presentations showing changes in understanding about best practices from other countries	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Translated the HB paper “Policies to support local markets” into Vietnamese</li> <li>The translated paper was sent to researchers of the Hanoi Institute for Socio-Economic Development Studies (HISEDs). It was a good reference for their ongoing research about public markets for policy recommendations to the city government. HB has committed to support them by providing them with reference for their research and comment on the draft report if any.</li> </ul>	Increased understanding of the HISEDs research team about international best practices of policies to preserve and develop urban public markets.	
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Tutored an intern to complete a case study about Chau Long Market to learn about the market’s role and how it is affected by the supermarket revolution. The research paper as an additional evidence about roles of public markets in Hanoi</li> </ul>	Increased understanding of the project team about the roles of public markets in Hanoi.	

		and the needs to preserve them.		
--	--	---------------------------------	--	--

The outcomes from activities conducted in 2015-16 have contributed to the LC program reaching the intermediate outcomes of the markets component of the program in 2014-16.

Intermediate outcomes	Reach/ results	Evaluation
Increase number of people who can access to affordable, healthy, fresh food in markets in urban areas.	The project has resulted in: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- three projects to replace markets being stopped</li> <li>- the government reconsidering the rebuilding of eight markets</li> <li>- the Vice Chairman of the People Committee announced the government decision to stop replacing markets with commercial centres</li> <li>- an estimated 2,700 vendors livelihoods were saved</li> <li>- an estimated 279,000 people who shop at these markets are able to continue to access healthy fresh food</li> </ul>	Though there was no statistics about changes in number of people who have access to food markets as well as in number of markets in Hanoi, the increased understanding of policy makers, local professionals and the public about markets issues was meaningful to the development of policies preserving and developing markets. This would result in increasing access to food markets in the city.

#### Component #4: Policy Development

**Table 4: Evaluation for component #4–Policy Development**

#	Expected outcomes	Activities	Results/ Reached	Evaluations/ outcome
<b>Policy Development</b>				
9	Increased policies on enabling environment for physical activities and access to healthy food	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Provided technical advice to the development of Proposal of Project on promotion of physical activities developed by the Sport for All Department:</li> </ul>	The draft proposal was presented to high-ranking leaders of the sport and cultural sector and received their support and comments.	Increased understanding and support of leaders of the Ministry of Sport, Culture and Tourism to improving enabling environment for

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ A meeting in 9/2015 between the editing team and the Vice Minister of Sport, Culture and Tourism to receive comments on the draft proposal.</li> <li>○ A meeting in 12/2015 between the editing team and the Director of the National Administration of Sport to receive comments on the draft proposal</li> <li>○ A meeting in 2/2016 to collect comments from departments under the Administration.</li> <li>○ Three editing team meetings to revise the draft proposal.</li> </ul>	<p>The draft proposal was revised three times according to the comments received. There were also feedbacks by the editing teams to the comments and questions to the drafts.</p> <p>The draft has been finalized and submitted to the Minister of Sport, Culture and Tourism for approval. It proposed a collaboration between the sectors of urban development, transportation, health, and education to create an enabling environment for physical activities, aiming to increase the proportion of people who doing regular physical activities by 10% by 2020.</p>	physical activities.
11	Increased awareness of Vietnamese representatives (Ministry of Construction) about SDG 11 and implementation measures relating to walking, cycling and public spaces	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Developed Vietnamese infographics about SDG 11</li> <li>• The infographics were posted on the website of Vietnam Architect Association: <a href="http://kienviet.net/2015/09/01/nhu-ng-sang-kien-thuc-hien-muc-tieu-thien-nien-ky/">http://kienviet.net/2015/09/01/nhu-ng-sang-kien-thuc-hien-muc-tieu-thien-nien-ky/</a></li> <li>• A meeting between the LC Program Director and leaders of the Urban Development Agency discussing about collaboration to promote Vietnam active participation to Habitat III.</li> </ul>	<p>Increased understanding of professionals about SDG and messages to promote healthy physical activities.</p> <p>Increased awareness among government officials about HealthBridge's role in supporting the implementation of SDG 11 and Habitat III.</p>	Unknown at this time.

## 2.2 Fundraising and Program/ Partnerships Development

#	Activities	Indicators	Evaluation/ Outcomes
---	------------	------------	----------------------

	Established a partnership with EMBARQ of World Resources Institute (WRI) to implement a project to promote safe access to BRT system in HCM City	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>An agreement between WRI and HBV to implement the project</li> </ul>	Increased funding for the LC project. Improved relations with WRI.
	<p>Strengthened partnership with the Volunteer group Think Playgrounds (TPG) and improved their capacity:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Involved TPG team members in our research/surveys on public spaces</li> <li>Collaborated with TPG in fund raising</li> <li>Connected them with local government and other organizations</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>3 joint-proposals of which one was awarded (by Citymart)</li> <li>TPG team members participated in our public garden survey and learned about research skills.</li> <li>TPG activities (organizing play days, building playgrounds) were successfully carried out with HB support.</li> </ul>	Improved their research and fundraising capacity

Intermediate outcomes	Reach/ results	Evaluation
HBV is seen as a key resource for Livable Cities initiatives in Vietnam.	<p>Three national policies were developed with our technical support (the NCD strategy, the Plan to promote physical activities, the Children Law)</p> <p>The partnership network was developed: five new partners: Think Playgrounds, Hoan Kiem district People's Committee, the Management Board of the Old Quarter, the Hanoi Fatherland Front, the Department of Sport for All (Ministry of Sport, Culture and Tourism)</p> <p>Two new donors: the Asia Foundation, EMBARQ-WRI.</p>	The networks of partners and donors have been strengthened and widened. The program contributed valuable comments to development of key policies. This has helped HBV coming towards important resource for LC initiatives in Vietnam.

### 2.3 Significant changes to the project

- The most significant change to the project was the replacement of the walking survey in Hoi An with a project to improve pedestrian safety and safe access to BRT in HCM which was conducted in partnership with EMBARQ-WRI. Regardless the change of the sites, the new project still helped us to reach the expected outcome of “increased our understanding of current traffic situation and opportunities to develop active transportation (in HCM City)” and “increased commitment from the city Government to improve active transportation in the city”. This activity change was approved by the Program Director. The project budget and timeline were changed accordingly and were also approved.

- Under the first component of open public spaces, when we were working to select a site for a pilot on low-cost playgrounds (in collaboration with TPG), the Management Board of the Old Quarter asked for our support to develop a plan to revitalize five public spaces in Chuong Duong ward. We found that such a plan was necessary to improve livability in the neighborhoods and also helped us can select the most suitable public spaces (out of the five) for the pilot. Therefore, we decided to conduct a survey for the plan development before the site selection for the pilot. By the end of this project year, we completed the survey and developed design options for revitalizing the five public spaces.
- The third changes were seen in our work in Hue city. We had to paid more efforts on advocating the local authorities for the development of the city park master plan, introducing them to Hoi An's experience and convincing them about the importance of the park master plan. This has delayed the implementation of the city public park survey, which was planned as the first step of the park master plan development to next year.

## 2.4 Lessons learned

- The activity to support improving pedestrian safety and safe access to BRT system is being implemented in HCM City which is a new project site for us. We had to set up new relationship with both the local partners (HCM City relevant agencies) and foreign partner (EMBARQ) to implement the activity. Apart from researching the traffic situation in HCM City, we also had to learn about the city's socio-economic, political situation to understand the local context.
- The project team had an ability and was allowed to implement the project in a flexible manner in accordance with the changing situation, arising opportunities to reach the goals of the project.

## 3. Recommendations

We recommend the results of the previous year should be followed up and intensified in the next period, specifically:

- Continue with supports to development of low-cost playgrounds in cities
- Increase support to Hue city to develop its park master plan.
- Conduct a walking environment survey in Hoi An city
- Continue the ASRTS pilot, with a focus on improving the walking environment around schools.
- Increase understanding of the project team and our partners about the livable city concept and the New Urban Agenda
- Strengthen and widen the network and partnership.
- Implement a fund raising strategy for the program

## 4. Presentations, Publications and submissions:

### **“Urban development: planning the cities for better health of communities” – Dinh Dang Hai, Senior Project Officer**

This article recommended to the national authorities several policies to encourage and direct local governments to develop their cities more livable. It was published in the proceeding of the workshop on development of the National Urban Development Strategy organized by the Urban Development Agency – MoC in April 2016.

**“Traditional Markets in Modernizing city” - Dinh Dang Hai, Senior Project Officer**

A presentation about the campaign to advocate Hanoi Government to change their policy of renovating local fresh markets with commercial centre and supermarkets. It was presented at Side event “Inclusive Cities: Working with the Informal Economy to Deliver on the New Urban Agenda” of Habitat 3, Prep Com 3 –Surabaya (Indonesia) Jul 2016

**“Hoian Park Master Plan: Lesson Learned” - Dinh Dang Hai, Senior Project Officer**

A presentation about the development process and the content of Hoian Park Master Plan, how HBV have supported the city of Hoian to develop their park plan until 2020. The presentation also introduced steps to develop a community playground. This presentation was presented at the workshop “Development of green public spaces in historical quarter of Hanoi: Current situation and solution” organized by Hanoi Institute for Socio – Economic Development Studies on November 4<sup>th</sup> 2015.

<http://vienktxh.hanoi.gov.vn/Default.aspx?TabId=238&Entry=375&Default.htm&AspxAutoDetectCookieSupport=1>

**“Park Master Plan in Hoian city, Vietnam” - Dinh Dang Hai, Senior Project Officer**

A presentation about the development process and the content of Hoian Park Master Plan as well as how HBV have supported the city of Hoian to develop their park plan until 2020. This presentation was presented at the Speed Dating at Walk21 Vienna in October 2015, after this project awarded the Jury Prize of the conference.

**“Playground Development in Hanoi city” - Dinh Dang Hai, Senior Project Officer**

A presentation about the Community Playground Development and the Livable Cities Project in Vietnam in a talkshow organized by to the Hanoi Architect Association on September 7<sup>th</sup> 2015 about the role of young architect in playground development in Hanoi city.

<http://kienviet.net/2015/09/08/kien-truc-su-tinh-nguyen-voi-san-choi-tre-em-trong-khu-dan-cu-ha-noi/>